The Clinical Handbook of Biofeedback
The Clinical Handbook of Biofeedback

A Step-by-Step Guide for Training and Practice with Mindfulness

Inna Z. Khazan
To my family – for always being there
# Contents

List of Figures                                           vii  
List of Tables                                           ix  
Acknowledgments                                          xi  
Introduction                                            xiii  

## Part I  Foundations  
1 Mindfulness and Acceptance Approach to Biofeedback  
2 General Issues in Biofeedback  
3 Biofeedback Equipment  

## Part II  Assessment  
4 Initial Evaluation  
5 Psychophysiological Stress Profile  
6 Psychophysiological Relaxation Profile  
7 Evidence-Based Treatment Planning  

## Part III  Biofeedback modalities  
8 Breathing  
9 Heart Rate Variability  
10 Surface Electromyography  
11 Temperature  
12 Skin Conductance  


Contents

Part IV  Biofeedback application  172
13  Anxiety  172
14  Asthma  196
15  Migraine Headaches  204
16  Tension-Type Headache  215
17  Essential Hypertension  224
18  Irritable Bowel Syndrome  234
19  Raynaud’s Phenomenon  242
20  Temporomandibular Joint Disorders  250
21  Chronic Low Back Pain and Other Chronic Pain Disorders  261
22  Emerging Directions  276

Appendix I Meditation Scripts  285
Appendix II Client Logs  300
Index  326
List of Figures

Figure 1.1  Quicksand Metaphor Illustration  11
Figure 5.1  Frontalis Sensor Placement  38
Figure 5.2  Narrow and Wide Upper Trapezius Placement  39
Figure 5.3  Mastoid-to-Mastoid Placement, Back and Side View  40
Figure 5.4  Temporal-to-Mastoid Placement, Side View  40
Figure 6.1  Typical Relaxation Profile Pattern  56
Figure 7.1  An Example of a Mostly Healthy Stress Profile  58
Figure 7.2  Stress Profile with Increasing Levels of Arousal and Little Recovery  59
Figure 7.3  Stress Profile with Evidence of Increased Activation during Recovery  60
Figure 8.1  Normal Respiration  70
Figure 8.2  Overbreathing  71
Figure 8.3  Examples of Different Breathing Patterns  83
Figure 8.4  Healthy Breathing and Overbreathing  84
Figure 9.1  (a) The Normal ECG Complex PQRST; (b) An ECG with Three R-R Intervals  98
Figure 9.2  Heart Rate Variability Oscillations  99
Figure 9.3  Respiratory Sinus Arrhythmia (RSA)  101
Figure 9.4  Faster and Slower Frequency Wave  102
Figure 9.5  Higher and Lower Amplitude Oscillations  103
Figure 9.6  Maximum–Minimum HRV  105
Figure 9.7  Spectral Analysis of HRV  106
Figure 9.8  Low Frequency “Meditator’s” Peak  107
Figure 9.9  Heart Rate, Percent of LF Peak, and Max–Min HRV during RF Determination  110
Figure 10.1  Needle EMG Activity at Trigger Point and Surrounding Muscle Tissue  123
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figure 10.2</th>
<th>Example of Wide and Narrow Sensor Placement</th>
<th>125</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Figure 10.3</td>
<td>Surface Electromyography Readings from the</td>
<td>125</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Forearm Muscle Using Wide and Narrow Sensor Placement</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 10.4</td>
<td>Surface Electromyography Recording made with Wide and Narrow Band-Pass Filter from the Same Upper Trapezius Muscle</td>
<td>126</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 10.5</td>
<td>Spectral Analysis of sEMG Signal from a Nonfatigued and a Fatigued Upper Trapezius Muscle during a Sustained Contraction</td>
<td>127</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 10.6</td>
<td>Example of Upper Trapezius Assessment Results</td>
<td>134</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 10.7</td>
<td>Muscle Recovery Assessment of a Healthy Muscle and a Chronically Tense/Fatigued Muscle</td>
<td>135</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 10.8</td>
<td>Example of Working-at-the-Computer Assessment Results</td>
<td>140</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 12.1</td>
<td>Upward Tonic Shift in Skin Conductance Response Following a Stressor</td>
<td>167</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 12.2</td>
<td>Downward Tonic Shift in Skin Conductance Response</td>
<td>167</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 12.3</td>
<td>Stair-Stepping Pattern in Skin Conductance Response during a Stress Profile</td>
<td>168</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 12.4</td>
<td>Optimal Skin Conductance Response following a Stressor</td>
<td>169</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 20.1</td>
<td>Masseter Sensor Placement</td>
<td>254</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
List of Tables

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Table 1.1</td>
<td>The Do’s and Don’ts of Mindful Biofeedback Practice</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 3.1</td>
<td>Listing of Smaller Scale Biofeedback Devices Available to Date</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 8.1</td>
<td>Template for Interpreting Breathing Assessment Results</td>
<td>85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 9.1</td>
<td>Resonance Frequency Breathing Rate Determination Template</td>
<td>109</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 9.2</td>
<td>Approximate Counts for Inhalation/Exhalation for Various Breathing Rates</td>
<td>111</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 10.1</td>
<td>Examples of Striation Direction of Muscles Most Commonly Used with sEMG Biofeedback</td>
<td>128</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 10.2</td>
<td>Postural and Position Changes to Facilitate Muscle Tension Deactivation</td>
<td>149</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 10.3</td>
<td>Examples of Quick Relaxation Skills Based on Longer Practices to Facilitate Muscle Deactivation Training</td>
<td>149</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 17.1</td>
<td>Classification of BP by the JNC</td>
<td>226</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
There are many people who made this book possible. While this acknowledgments page cannot possibly do justice to their invaluable contribution, I will do my best to give thanks.

First, I would like to thank my teachers and mentors. Satya Bellerose was my first biofeedback teacher. Satya, thank you for not only teaching me biofeedback, but for inspiring me to pursue it as a career. Thank you to Saul Rosenthal for his mentorship and support for this book. I am grateful to Judy Krulewitz for her support and wisdom every step of the way.

Christopher Germer has been my mindfulness teacher and mentor for many years. He has also been my guide throughout the process of writing this book. Chris, thank you for introducing me to the power of mindfulness, helping me work through the kinks of integrating biofeedback and mindfulness together, and, most of all, for believing that this endeavor is worthwhile.

I would like to thank the experts in the field of biofeedback who have kindly shared their knowledge and expertise with me during the preparation of this book. A special thank you to Richard Gevirtz for his support at the early stages of this journey; his generosity in giving advice; sharing knowledge, materials, and images; and reviewing the heart rate variability (HRV) chapter of this book. I owe a debt of gratitude to Erik Peper for his advice in the writing of the electromyography (EMG) chapter, invaluable suggestions for its improvement, sharing images, and overall encouragement. To Peter Litchfield, thank you for so generously sharing your time in going over the intricacies of breathing physiology and training, sharing the breathing questionnaire, and the loan of the CapnoTrainer capnometer for testing out the protocols and capturing screen shots. I am grateful to Paul Lehrer for letting me pick his brain in the early stages of planning this book and sharing his tremendous knowledge and expertise in the field of HRV.

I am grateful to the makers of biofeedback equipment that was generously loaned to me to test out the protocols I describe and capture screen shots using multiple
Acknowledgments

types of equipment. Thank you to Lawrence Klein and Thought Technology for the loan of the Infinity system and for your support in the early stages of the writing of this book. To Stephen Stern, Stens Biofeedback, and Mind Media – thank you for the generous loan of the NeXus 10 system and for your overall support. It was a privilege to be able to work with these incredibly powerful and versatile biofeedback systems.

I am honored to have worked with the talented team at Wiley-Blackwell. Darren Reed, thank you for believing in the idea of this book when I first proposed it and for transforming the idea into reality. Maria Teresa M. Salazar of Toppan Best-Set Premedia Ltd., thank you for your thoughtful editing of the book. Thank you to the rest of the team at Wiley for their hard work in making the book happen – Karen Shield, Mirjana Misina, Kathy Syplywczak, Olivia Evans, and everyone else working behind the scenes.

Thank you to Catherine Schuman and the Cambridge Health Alliance (CHA)/Harvard Medical School for giving me a teaching home. Cathy, thank you for the time we spent talking about biofeedback, your enthusiastic support for the book, and for your work in continuing the practice of biofeedback at CHA.

A special thank you to my colleagues and friends Elizabeth Gagnon and Susan Hileman for their support whenever it was most needed.

And to my students and clients, whom I cannot thank by name, thank you for helping me refine the ideas and skills I have summarized in this book. None of this would have been possible without you!

I owe a debt of gratitude to my family and friends who were by my side throughout this process in so many ways. To my amazing husband Roger – thank you for your love and support, your endless patience, and your willingness to take over all of the household responsibilities on so many occasions while I was finishing the book. Thank you for editing multiple chapters of this book and for the encouragement whenever I’ve wanted to give up. To my Mom and Dad, Sima and Simon Zaslavsky – thank you for your unconditional love, support, and encouragement. Dad, thank you for editing almost every chapter in the book and for your sage advice whenever I’ve felt stuck. Thank you to my parents-in-law, Lana Brodsky and Leonard Khazan, for believing in me, reading and editing chapters, and serving as an example of hard work and perseverance.

I am fortunate to have an incredible group of friends who are always willing to help in whatever way needed. Thank you to Lucy and Igor Lubashev for editing, helping me figure out the quirky details, and, Igor, for being a willing guinea pig in testing out new protocols. Thank you to Marina Shtern, Eugene and Anya Dashevsky, Dan and Marianna Utin, Katya and Leonid Taycher, and Maria and Leo Mirkis for emotional support and encouragement along the way.

And last but not least, thank you to my wonderful children – you are the light of my life, my inspiration; thank you for being who you are.
I had started writing this book in my mind long before I realized that my musings could become a book. I was introduced to biofeedback by Dr. Satya Bellerose during my graduate training at the Cambridge Health Alliance/Harvard Medical School (CHA/HMS). I was immediately impressed with its effectiveness and the range of applications. Biofeedback seemed the perfect way to combine skills of a therapist with modern technological ability to look inside one’s body. In working with clients, when biofeedback training went smoothly, it was effective, and my clients felt successful and experienced relief from their symptoms. But there were also times when treatment stalled, progress was slow, and no amount of effort could bring it back on track. I was unsettled about this and wanted to find an approach that would give more consistent results.

A few years after I began working with biofeedback, I met Dr. Christopher Germer, who introduced me to the mindfulness approach to psychotherapy. Mindfulness allows people to become truly aware of the present moment, to tell the difference between what they can and cannot change, and then focus their attention on the things they can change.

After analyzing the cases where biofeedback was not immediately successful, I realized that the reason for the lack of progress with biofeedback in some cases was that we were trying hard to change what was not changeable at that moment. Using mindfulness transformed my biofeedback work. I suddenly had a way to help my clients get unstuck and make progress. My clients and I learned to allow what is outside of our control to stay and apply our efforts to things we could control.

For example, Dave came to me for treatment of chronic migraines. He learned to warm up his hands when he felt well, but every time he tried to warm up his hands when he was in pain, his finger temperature plummeted and his pain got worse. We figured out that he was trying really hard to get rid of the pain by raising his finger temperature. His focus was on the numbers on the thermometer and his level of pain. When he learned to accept the pain he had at that moment, and bring
his focus to his image of warmth, he allowed his finger temperature to rise and bring relief from pain.

Throughout the years that I have been teaching biofeedback at CHA/HMS, many of my students have asked for detailed written instructions on how to practically utilize their biofeedback skills. They asked questions on how exactly to implement the mindfulness skills that many of them were already familiar with. This is when the idea for this book was born.

I started thinking about a way to provide biofeedback therapists with the practical guidelines on implementing their skills into clinical practice and enhancing their biofeedback practice with mindfulness and acceptance. The protocols I present in this book come from the materials I developed, and then polished and honed over several years with the students at CHA/HMS.

This go-to guide is intended for clinicians who have already had at least an introductory training in biofeedback and are interested in learning how to apply that knowledge in the clinical setting and for clinicians with an established biofeedback practice who are interested in enriching their practice and further improving their client outcomes. This book may also be useful to mindfulness clinicians who are interested in exploring ways of integrating biofeedback into their practice.

I begin the book with a chapter on integrating mindfulness into biofeedback. I chose to begin with mindfulness because I believe it provides an excellent framework to think about biofeedback. Use that first chapter as a jumping-off point into biofeedback, which will be the easiest way to integrate mindfulness into your biofeedback practice.

Some of you might also wonder whether this book will be useful to you if you are not interested in using mindfulness practices with your clients. The answer is yes, the protocols presented in this book can be used without the introduction to mindfulness. The information regarding biofeedback modalities and the use of specific protocols does not depend on your use of mindfulness and references to mindfulness training may be omitted. That said, I still encourage you to consider using a mindfulness and acceptance approach to biofeedback.

The rest of the book is divided into four sections:

- The first section deals with the general practicalities of biofeedback, including instrumentation, where I talk about many different kinds of biofeedback devices available, from the comprehensive full-scale equipment to simple inexpensive devices you can start using in your early forays into biofeedback.
- The second section deals with assessment, including initial evaluation, biofeedback profiles, and treatment planning.
- The third section is devoted to five peripheral biofeedback modalities – heart rate variability, breathing, surface electromyography, temperature, and skin conductance. Please note that I do not talk about electroencephalography (EEG) biofeedback, or neurofeedback, for which many excellent texts are available.
- The fourth and final section presents detailed protocols for several psychophysiological disorders for which biofeedback has been shown to be an efficacious treatment.
I hope you will find this book useful in your work with clients by acquiring new ways to think about biofeedback and by having a place to turn to when you feel stuck or have specific questions about the process!

If you would like to be kept up-to-date with new developments related to this book, please visit my website www.BostonHealthPsychology.com where you can sign up to be on the mailing list.

Dr. Inna Z. Khazan
Boston, MA
“Why can’t I get control of my anxiety?” “Why won’t the pain go away?” “What’s wrong with me, why can’t I do this right?” Does any of that sound familiar? Have you heard questions like these from your clients? If your answer is yes, then this book is for you. Let us talk about how it might be useful.

Sam’s Fight for Control

Sam is an accomplished professional woman in her early thirties, who is used to being able to do things she sets out to do. She has a business degree from a prestigious university, and is doing well in her career. About two years ago she started having episodes of anxiety that were difficult to handle. At first, they occurred only when she needed to give presentations to larger audiences at work, but have gradually started creeping into situations that had previously been completely comfortable, like team meetings and phone conferences. Because of how distressing this anxiety felt, Sam started trying to avoid big presentations, spoke up as little as possible at team meetings, and dreaded phone conferences. When the issue came up in her annual review with the manager, Sam realized that anxiety might really get in the way of her career, so she did what she usually does when faced with a challenge – she took the bull by the horns.

Sam came to treatment with the goal of getting control of her anxiety and she wanted to try biofeedback. She learned that dysfunctional breathing had a lot to do with her physical symptoms and with intensifying her anxiety. She became
determined to learn and use the new breathing skills. However, Sam found breathing practices to be difficult and uncomfortable, and when she tried to use them when she was anxious, it made the anxiety worse. She worked hard to control her breathing in order to control her anxiety and it was not working. She became frustrated and was ready to give up on treatment.

I suggested a new approach. Since trying to get control was not helping, what if she were to give up trying to get control and change her goals for breathing practices and for her treatment? Sam was slightly skeptical at first, but was also open to a new approach. She was willing to let go of trying to control her anxiety and just practice breathing for the sake of breathing, attend meetings and conferences for the sake of meetings and conferences, and so on, and not for the purpose of controlling anxiety. She learned how to attend mindfully to her breath and how to make space for all of her experience, including anxious thoughts, feelings, and physical symptoms. She made it her goal to be present at her meetings and phone conferences instead of figuring out ways to control anxiety. The result? Sam’s anxiety did not go away. She gets some anxiety before most presentations, and many meetings and phone conferences. So what has changed? She is now making presentations to large audiences and speaking up in her team meetings and not getting stuck in dread of phone conferences. Her attitude toward her anxiety has changed since she has allowed it to be. Her use of breathing skills has changed too. She is using biofeedback breathing in order to restore her blood chemistry and because it is helpful in bringing peace and allowing her to focus on the presentation she is about to give. Her focus changed from controlling anxiety to making choices over her actions when speaking opportunities came around. She has given up control over her anxiety and has regained control of her career.

Jack’s Struggle with the Present Moment

Jack is a 50-year-old software engineer who came to me for treatment of chronic back pain that remained after a serious car accident 10 years ago. He has been through many medical treatments, has had acupuncture and massage treatments, and has seen two previous therapists. Jack spent a lot of time sitting because of his job and prolonged periods of sitting made the pain worse. Only opioid medication and lying down made the pain tolerable. He reported that his pain was constant and he spent a lot of time wishing he had not been on the road the day of the accident and wishing for the pain to go away. Jack felt trapped in the pain because he could not get away from it.

Jack came to me seeking biofeedback treatment because it was the only thing he has not yet tried. We did a biofeedback assessment and found very high levels of muscle tension and breathing dysfunction. He was somewhat frustrated with me when I suggested starting with mindfulness training before proceeding to biofeedback training. He was concerned that accepting the present moment meant giving in to the pain and giving up on ever getting better. However, eventually he under-
stood that acceptance was about making room for all of his experience in the present moment instead of keeping a narrow focus on stopping the pain and about learning to live a life worth living, instead of giving up on life.

Jack practiced mindful breathing, body awareness, and mindfulness of thoughts, feelings, and physiological sensations. He noticed that his pain was not constant, but rather coming and going. He noticed that he could attend to other parts of his experience while having pain. At that point, we began biofeedback training. He learned to recognize what it felt like when his muscles tensed up. He kept a log of his muscle tension and pain, and learned the triggers for muscle tension and for increases in pain. With surface electromyography (sEMG) biofeedback, he learned to release the tension in his muscles when he noticed it, and he learned to soften his muscles instead of bracing when his pain increased. With breathing biofeedback, he learned to change his breathing to bring balance to his blood chemistry. He learned that pain is not the same thing as suffering. Applying his biofeedback skills mindfully allowed Jack to greatly alleviate his suffering and to become a more active participant in the rest of his life. He still has some pain, which is sometimes dull, and sometimes intense, and sometimes barely there. He has learned to apply biofeedback skills to increase his openness instead of narrowing his focus in the face of pain.

Bethany’s Failure

Bethany is a stay-at-home mom to two active boys. She is in her forties and has had periodic incapacitating migraines since she was a teenager. She came to see me when she thought that her migraines were getting more frequent and affecting her ability to be a good mother. When a migraine came, Bethany felt she could do nothing else except lie down in a quiet dark room, but spent much of that time beating up on herself for not being able to “get a hold of” herself.

Bethany was interested in both mindfulness and biofeedback treatment, and her neurologist recommended biofeedback. We started with a stress profile, which revealed that her finger temperature was low at baseline and got lower with each stressor with no recovery. Her breathing was also fast and shallow and her heart rate variability (HRV) was low. Bethany liked the idea of mindfulness training before proceeding to biofeedback skills. She was willing to observe her breathing and make space for her pain. She enjoyed the meditations I taught her and listened to the recordings every day.

When we started biofeedback, she learned to increase her HRV with her breathing nicely in my office. She was able to use mindful awareness to let her breathing fall in sync with her heart rate. She started practicing resonance frequency breathing at home. She was also keeping a log of her breathing practices and finger temperature. After the first week of home practice of her biofeedback skills, Bethany came back and said that she did not do so well on her own. She felt that she failed to achieve her goals. It sounded to me like she was spending a lot of time virtually beating up
on herself, and Bethany agreed that being hard on herself felt like the way to motivate herself to do and be better.

I asked Bethany whether she was interested in learning how to be kinder to herself and how to let go of impossible-to-reach goals. She agreed. We talked about self-compassion and about setting achievable goals. Perhaps being able to stick to resonance frequency breathing rate and increase her finger temperature after one session of actual biofeedback training was unnecessary and as unrealistic as being able to power through a severe migraine. Bethany learned the loving kindness meditation. She learned to not only allow her biofeedback skills to happen at the moment she practiced them, but also to be kind to herself no matter what the outcome of her practice. Sometimes she felt she was in the zone with her breathing and her finger temperature increased. There were also times when her finger temperature did not budge. She was able to allow “a failure” to happen and move on with her day. Bethany learned to be kind to herself when she had migraines, and allowed herself to ask for help and to take care of herself by letting go of whatever self-judgments automatically came with the need to ask for help. Practicing biofeedback skills became easier when she was no longer trying to evaluate whether she was doing them right, and having her migraines, which became less frequent and less severe, became easier too.

With these three examples, I hope to introduce you to the main ways in which mindfulness may be helpful to you and to your clients. To summarize, mindfulness is useful for at least three reasons:

1. **Sometimes we work really hard to control what is out of our control**, the way Sam tried to control her anxiety. Mindfulness can teach you to tell the difference between what is and is not controllable, and choose to direct your resources toward creating the behavioral changes that are within your control.

2. **Sometimes we struggle to make the present moment be different**, the way Jack tried to stop the pain. Mindfulness gives us the freedom to choose our responses, rather than following with automatic struggle and to attend fully to our experience instead of narrowly focusing on the object of the struggle.

3. **Sometimes we judge ourselves for failing to reach our goals**, the way Bethany judged herself as a failure for failing to power through migraines and learn her skills in one week. With mindfulness, we learn to give ourselves a break, to be kinder to ourselves, which then allows us to turn toward our experiences with curiosity and interest, and gives us an opportunity to create change.

In this chapter, I give an introduction to mindfulness and acceptance approach, discuss its relevance to biofeedback, and give a brief overview of research demonstrating effectiveness of the mindfulness and acceptance approach in producing desirable physiological and neurological changes. I then focus on implementing mindfulness into your biofeedback practice, including a step-by-step guide.
What Are Mindfulness and Acceptance?

Let us begin with talking about what mindfulness is and how it is helpful. There are many definitions, each touching on slightly different aspects of mindfulness. As described by Christopher Germer, its literal translation from Pali, the language of earliest Buddhist writings, is “awareness, remembering.” Awareness is most relevant to the modern definitions of mindfulness, often described as simply moment-to-moment awareness. Guy Armstrong defines mindfulness as “Knowing what you are experiencing while you are experiencing it.” Finally, a definition similar to Jon Kabat Zinn’s is “being in the present moment, accepting, letting go of judgment.”

Ruth Baer and colleagues (2004) identified five facets of mindfulness, reflecting all the major components of mindfulness practice and mindfulness interventions. These components are:

- **Observing** – attending to internal and external stimuli
- **Describing** – labeling one’s experience with words
- **Acting with awareness** – choosing action, instead of behaving automatically
- **Nonjudgmental stance** – letting go of evaluation of one’s internal experience
- **Nonreactivity to internal experience** – allowing thoughts and feeling to come and go, without getting caught up in them.

I will continue referring to every one of these components throughout this chapter and the rest of the book.

Acceptance is a concept closely related to mindfulness. Steven Hayes, the founder of Acceptance and Commitment Therapy (ACT), describes it as “Active, nonjudgmental embracing of experience in the here and now.” Acceptance is also a way to live with your thoughts and feelings instead of struggling against them and a way of allowing yourself to stop avoiding pain, both emotional and physical.

You might be wondering how this is relevant to biofeedback. First, awareness is something that mindfulness and biofeedback share as a necessary component. In biofeedback, we first train our clients in awareness of their physiological sensations before they are able to learn and implement biofeedback skills. Mindful awareness of the present moment will make training awareness of physiological sensations easier. Second, mindful approach will help the client focus on what is most helpful about biofeedback. Third, integrating mindfulness into biofeedback practice allows us to work with what gets in the way of biofeedback success:

- Automatic reactions to thoughts, feelings, and physiological sensations
- Attempts to control or resist
- Judgment.

And even more specifically, mindfulness can help with
• Relaxation-induced anxiety
• Feeling stuck
• Pressure to get things just right
• Feeling distracted
• Racing thoughts
• Emotional reactions to physiological issues
• Feelings of failure.

Research Findings

Before continuing to talk about specific ways of integrating mindfulness into biofeedback, I briefly review some research findings demonstrating the effectiveness of mindfulness in promoting changes relevant to biofeedback. This is not an exhaustive list by any means, but rather a selection of the most relevant studies.

Much of the mindfulness research is based on Jon Kabat-Zinn’s Mindfulness-Based Stress Reduction program, or MBSR. For those of you not familiar with MBSR, it is an eight-week-long program with 2.5-hour meetings plus one full-day meeting in week 6. Stress reduction is promoted through mindfulness practices such as body scan, mindful yoga, and sitting meditation. Participants are provided with audio recordings and asked to practice for 45 minutes each day and keep a log of their practices. In research studies, it appears that the average actual practice time is about 30 minutes a day.

Richard Davidson and colleagues (2003) recruited two groups of students, one of which participated in MBSR training, and the other served as control. Both groups were asked to write about one of the most positive experiences in their lives and one of the most negative experiences in their lives. EEG recordings were made before and after the writing exercise. Both groups were also given a flu vaccine prior to the experimental group’s MBSR training, and their blood was drawn after the training. The study findings revealed that MBSR group had increased activation of the left frontal region of the brain, which is responsible for producing positive emotions. Moreover, the MBSR group had more antibodies to the vaccine, meaning that their immune system function was higher, and so was their protection against the flu.

David Creswell and his colleagues (2009) demonstrated a similarly increased immune response in patients with HIV who participated in MBSR training. This group had stable CD4+ T-lymphocyte (immune cell) counts after the training and the more they practiced, the more benefit they received. The control group, however, exhibited CD4+ declines typical of patients with HIV.

In a series of studies by Linda Carlson and colleagues (Carlson et al., 2003, 2004, 2007), patients with breast and prostate cancer who participated in the MBSR training exhibited increased quality of life and positive changes in the function of the hypothalamic–pituitary–adrenal (HPA) axis and the immune system. These findings persisted at one-year follow up.
Thaddeus Pace and colleagues (2008) showed that greater amount of time spent practicing compassion during 8 weeks of training was associated with a decrease in the levels of interleukin-6, an inflammatory protein. Thus, compassion meditation seems to promote a decrease of inflammation in the body.

Since one of the main goals of biofeedback is enabling people to change their physiological functioning, these studies show that mindfulness may further aid biofeedback in creating desirable physiological change.

In a series of fascinating studies, Sara Lazar, Britta Hölzel, and their colleagues at Massachusetts General Hospital demonstrated that mindfulness meditation produces both structural and functional changes in the brain (e.g., Hölzel et al., 2010, 2011). These studies looked at the brains of people who underwent MBSR training using functional magnetic resonance imaging (fMRI) and compared them with the brains of people with no MBSR training. The results showed that some parts of the brain became larger (increased gray matter), some became smaller, and others became more active. The following list shows a summary of findings from several studies:

- **Increased gray matter in:**
  - hippocampus, responsible for learning, memory, and emotion regulation
  - right insula, responsible for interoceptive awareness, empathy, and perspective taking
  - temporoparietal junction (TPJ), responsible for conscious experience of the self, social cognition, and compassion
  - posterior cingulate cortex (PCC), responsible for integration of self-referential stimuli
  - lateral cerebellum and cerebellar vermis, responsible for emotional and cognitive regulation: speed, capacity, consistency, and appropriateness of cognitive and emotional processes

- **Decreased gray matter in:**
  - right amygdala, responsible for fear and anxiety

- **Increased activation in:**
  - anterior cingulate cortex (ACC), responsible for regulation of attention and behavioral control
  - right insula.

Furthermore, Sara Lazar et al. (2005) also showed that experienced meditators, those with at least 2000 hours of meditation experience, exhibit greater cortical thickness in the prefrontal cortex, which is responsible for executive function activities such as planning, problem solving, and attention. Similarly, Jha et al. (2007) demonstrated that mindfulness training is associated with improvement in attention.

Many of the functional and structural changes observed in these studies are directly relevant to the issues we often encounter in our biofeedback practice. For example, a decreased size of the right amygdala is relevant for clients struggling with
anxiety and any kind of chronic condition with symptoms that evoke fear. Mindfulness meditation can be helpful in reducing the automatic amygdala-mediated response to the feared physiological sensations, while biofeedback can provide these clients with skills in addressing the arising symptoms.

There also exists a large body of research demonstrating efficacy of mindfulness-based interventions in reducing symptoms of anxiety (Roemer et al., 2008; Hofmann et al., 2010; Treanor et al., 2011), depression (Teasdale et al., 2000; Hofmann et al., 2010), substance abuse (Bowen et al., 2006), and fibromyalgia (Grossman et al., 2007), as well as improving well-being and quality of life (e.g., Carmody and Baer, 2008).

The Practical: How Do You Integrate Mindfulness into Your Biofeedback Practice?

Giving up the futile effort of trying to control

Control is a word very frequently used in biofeedback. So often our clients come to us wanting to learn to “get control” over their pain, or anxiety, or some other unpleasant experience. Sam, whose experience I described at the beginning of this chapter, had just this goal in mind.

In many ways, it makes sense: a sense of control is very important to every human being and many nonhuman animals. You have probably read about Martin Seligman’s experiments on learned helplessness, which showed that having control over a difficult situation helps people, as well as dogs, to get through it. There are studies showing that employees who do not have much control over their work, their schedule, and their environment have many more physical and mental health problems than those who do have the ability to make choices at work. There are many more examples of people’s need for control over their lives.

Therefore, why not talk about control in biofeedback? Why not talk about control over one’s pain and anxiety? Would it not be wonderful if we had that kind of power? The problem is that we do not have immediate control over much of our internal experience. If you have ever tried to control your anxiety or pain, you may have found it does not do what you want it to do. Our internal experience is always changing, with sensations sometimes getting stronger, sometimes becoming weaker, and sometimes staying the same. The wonderful thing is that when physical or emotional pain is intense, it will change. Our actions (such as biofeedback skills) may facilitate the change, but cannot control it. Our efforts to control the internal experience itself are likely to be counterproductive and lead to exacerbation, instead of alleviation, of the problem.

Think about what happens with efforts to control. As with any kind of effort, the sympathetic nervous system is activated. This is usually the opposite of what we are trying to achieve. Most biofeedback skills we teach to our clients are aimed at reduc-
ing sympathetic activation and activating the parasympathetic response. And in doing the opposite of what we are trying to achieve, we are tying up our resources in a pointless fight and setting ourselves up for failure because we are trying to achieve an impossible goal.

As a specific example, let us take the idea of “trying to relax,” which is something our clients do on a regular basis. Trying involves sympathetic activation. Relaxation involves parasympathetic activation. Both sympathetic and parasympathetic branches of the autonomic nervous system cannot be dominant at the same time. Therefore, “trying to relax” is physiologically impossible. The term “trying to relax” is an oxymoron.

Two studies by Daniel Wegner and his colleagues (1997) demonstrated exactly this phenomenon. In these studies, participants were instructed to relax while engaging in challenging mental tasks. The skin conductance response of these participants increased during the tasks and was significantly higher than the skin conductance of a control group that was not instructed to relax while performing the same mental tasks.

In earlier studies, Wegner and colleagues (e.g., Wegner et al., 1987) showed that efforts to control and suppress thoughts, such as thoughts about a white bear, significantly increased the occurrence of these thoughts compared with people who were specifically asked to actively think about the white bear. These findings were further confirmed by many studies, including one by Koster et al. (2003), which demonstrated that thought suppression during a threatening event results in increased experience of anxiety and anxiety-related thoughts following the thought suppression exercise.

Similarly, Roy Baumeister and his colleagues conducted a series of studies in which they showed that efforts to control one’s emotional experience lead to lowered blood glucose levels and worse performance on difficult cognitive tasks. In one such study (Baumeister et al., 1998), two groups of college students watched a very emotional scene from the movie Terms of Endearment, where a young mother is dying and saying good-bye to her children. One of these groups was instructed to control and suppress their emotional experience while watching the movie clip. The other group was instructed to have their emotional experience the way it is. The group that was instructed to suppress their emotions performed significantly worse on an anagram-solving task that followed the movie clip than the group that was not suppressing their emotions.

Another controlled study by the same group (Gailliot et al., 2007) demonstrated that acts of self-control, such as emotion suppression, decrease participants’ blood sugar levels. Lower blood sugar levels were associated with worse performance and quicker giving up on challenging cognitive tasks.

Therefore, futile efforts to control the uncontrollable literally drain us of resources. Glucose is the most basic source of energy for our bodies, including the brain. Trying to control what is not in our control, such as our thoughts and feelings, focuses our available resources on that futile fight, not leaving sufficient energy for much of anything else.
At this point you may be scratching your head and wondering how this could possibly be relevant to biofeedback, since biofeedback is all about change. Therefore, let us make one thing very clear – we are not giving up on improving functioning, and we are not giving up on change. We are just giving up futile efforts to control what is not under our control. We are reallocating our resources to what is possible to control and what is possible to change in the moment, which are our responses and our actions.

We have choices when it comes to the way we respond to our thoughts and feelings, but we do not have control over the thoughts and feelings themselves. We have choices in the way we respond to physical sensations, but we do not have control, in that moment, over the physical sensations themselves. Biofeedback skills are most effective when used as a part of an intelligent response to feeling bad instead of as part of a futile effort to control thoughts and feelings. My client Sam learned that efforts to control her breathing in order to control her anxiety made things worse. When she learned to allow her breathing to change as a way of responding to having anxiety, her experience changed as well.

Getting unstuck

Our clients work so hard to fight with their present experience that they unwittingly end up getting stuck in the misery. An ACT metaphor describes this experience perfectly: imagine you are walking, going about your business, and unexpectedly step into quicksand. Your legs sink up to the ankles. What is your initial automatic reaction? You try to get away by lifting one leg out. And as a result, you reduce the area of your body in contact with the quicksand, increase the pressure, and sink some more. The more you struggle, the more you sink. How do you get out? The best way is to move slowly to change your position and lie down on your back to allow your body to float on the quicksand. This way you are reducing the pressure on quicksand, by increasing the surface area of your body in contact with the quicksand. You can actually float on quicksand much easier than on water because quicksand is denser than water. Once you are floating on your back, you can paddle to the edge of quicksand, come out and move on (Figure 1.1).

Here is one more fact about quicksand you may not have known – it is actually not nearly as dangerous as people often think it is. It is almost impossible to drown in quicksand, as it is rarely more than a couple of feet deep. It is possible to get stuck in quicksand and have difficulty getting out (i.e., the main danger of quicksand), which happens mostly if you struggle. Giving up the struggle and allowing as much of your body as possible to touch quicksand is the way to get out and move on.

People’s experience of getting stuck in difficult feelings is very similar. When you first notice the presence of difficult emotions or physiological sensations, the initial automatic reaction is to get away from them, to struggle. The effort to get away increases the focus on and the resources devoted to the difficult feelings, and it gets you stuck. Just like with quicksand, the more you struggle, the more stuck you get.
Just like with quicksand, the solution is to open up to the difficult emotions or physiological sensations, “float” on them, and eventually be able to move on. Again, just like quicksand, these difficult feelings are rarely dangerous; people only think that they are. Giving up the struggle and allowing yourself to have your feelings just the way they are is the way to get unstuck and move on.

With mindfulness, you can learn to recognize the automatic struggle reaction and pause long enough to choose the most helpful response.

**Changing the intention**

The way to give up futile efforts to control and to get unstuck is through changing the intention for your action, the intention of your response to difficult feelings. If your intention remains to stop being anxious or to get away from the pain in that moment, your actions are still likely to lead you into struggle and into being stuck. Changing the intention will change the result. If you change the intention from getting away from anxiety to allowing anxiety while you focus on what is most important in that moment, your experience of anxiety will change, and you will be more present in that moment of your life. If you change your intention from stopping pain in that moment to taking care of yourself because you are in pain, your experience of pain will change, and you will feel less distress and suffering.

Strangely enough, the action guided by the new intention may look exactly the same as the action you would have taken with the old intention. And yet, the result
will be different. Remember Sam who was anxious before giving a presentation? Before learning mindfulness, her intention would have been to get away from anxiety. She would have engaged in her biofeedback breathing skills in an effort to stop being anxious before and during the presentation. As a result, a large part of Sam’s mental resources would have gone toward stopping anxiety; her breathing would have been effortful with a greater chance of overbreathing. Her anxiety would have still been there or gotten worse and her full attention would not have been on the presentation. With mindfulness training, Sam’s response to the anxiety may still be the same biofeedback breathing skills, but with the intention of balancing her blood chemistry and helping her focus on the presentation. With the new intention, having given up the fight to stop anxiety, Sam is now able to allow the helpful change in her breathing and to bring attention to the goals of her presentation, which may be to connect with her audience and deliver a clear message.

Now let us return to Jack and his pain. Before mindfulness training, when Jack was in pain, he would have tried to relax his muscles with the intention of stopping pain in that moment. He would have put effort into the exercise, creating rather than releasing muscle tension. With mindfulness training, and with a new intention of taking care of himself because he is in pain, Jack now uses the same biofeedback skills to release the muscle tension and soften his muscles instead of bracing for pain. The result is different now as his experience of pain changes and his suffering decreases.

In the following list, I include some examples of changing the intention with respect to biofeedback skills. Instead of using biofeedback skills in order to stop or get away from a feeling or physiological sensation, help your clients use biofeedback skills in order to:

- take care of themselves at the time of distress or suffering
- restore balance to blood chemistry
- restore balance to the nervous system
- allow the body to become more peaceful
- allow the mind to refocus on the present moment
- bring comfort when feeling bad.

Mindful language

Mindful language plays a significant role in change of intention and in promoting helpful physiological changes. The human mind forms a strong association between words and certain automatic reactions, including those of the autonomic nervous system. Choice of words may make the difference between activation of the sympathetic and parasympathetic nervous systems.

Words like “control,” “effort,” “try,” and “work” have strong associations with sympathetic activation. As I previously said, trying to relax is physiologically impossible because trying activates the sympathetic nervous system, when parasympathetic activation is necessary for relaxation. When our clients talk and think about