



ROBERT DIYANNI

# CRITICAL AND CREATIVE THINKING

A BRIEF GUIDE FOR TEACHERS

WILEY Blackwell



# **Critical and Creative Thinking**



# **Critical and Creative Thinking**

*A Brief Guide for Teachers*

Robert DiYanni

**WILEY** Blackwell

This edition first published 2016  
© 2016 John Wiley & Sons, Inc.

*Registered Office*

John Wiley & Sons Ltd, The Atrium, Southern Gate, Chichester, West Sussex,  
PO19 8SQ, UK

*Editorial Offices*

350 Main Street, Malden, MA 02148-5020, USA  
9600 Garsington Road, Oxford, OX4 2DQ, UK  
The Atrium, Southern Gate, Chichester, West Sussex, PO19 8SQ, UK

For details of our global editorial offices, for customer services, and for information about how to apply for permission to reuse the copyright material in this book please see our website at [www.wiley.com/wiley-blackwell](http://www.wiley.com/wiley-blackwell).

The right of Robert DiYanni to be identified as the author of this work has been asserted in accordance with the UK Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, except as permitted by the UK Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988, without the prior permission of the publisher.

Wiley also publishes its books in a variety of electronic formats. Some content that appears in print may not be available in electronic books.

Designations used by companies to distinguish their products are often claimed as trademarks. All brand names and product names used in this book are trade names, service marks, trademarks or registered trademarks of their respective owners. The publisher is not associated with any product or vendor mentioned in this book.

**Limit of Liability/Disclaimer of Warranty:** While the publisher and author have used their best efforts in preparing this book, they make no representations or warranties with respect to the accuracy or completeness of the contents of this book and specifically disclaim any implied warranties of merchantability or fitness for a particular purpose. It is sold on the understanding that the publisher is not engaged in rendering professional services and neither the publisher nor the author shall be liable for damages arising herefrom. If professional advice or other expert assistance is required, the services of a competent professional should be sought.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication data is available for this book.

ISBN 9781118955376 (hardback); ISBN 9781118955383 (paperback)

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

Cover image: © kimberlywood / Shutterstock

Set in 11/13.5pt Plantin by Aptara Inc., New Delhi, India

*For Joan Weber and Carl Weber*

*For my dear friends Dr. Joan Weber  
and Dr. Carl Weber, who have consistently demonstrated  
exemplary leadership in education and in medicine, with  
generosity, grace, and compassion.*





# Contents

Preface	xi
Acknowledgments	xiii
About the Website	xv

## **Part One Introducing Critical and Creative Thinking**

<b>1 Essential Critical Thinking Concepts</b>	<b>3</b>
What Is Critical Thinking?	4
Habits of Mind	5
Why Intellectual Habits and Character Matter	7
Overcoming Obstacles to Thinking	8
A Model for Critical Thinking	13
How You Know What You Know	14
Perception and Knowledge	15
Being Wrong	23
Why Errors Persist	25
Applications	27
References	30
<i>Interchapter 1 Facts and Knowledge</i>	<b>32</b>
<b>2 Essential Creative Thinking Concepts</b>	<b>36</b>
What Is Creative Thinking?	37
Seeking Alternatives and Possibilities	38
Reversing Relationships	41
Cross-fertilizing	42
Shifting Attention	42

Contents

Denying the Negative	43
The Creative Habit	46
Creative Confidence	48
Creative Theft	49
Creative Crime	51
Creative Questions	52
Applications	56
References	58
<b><i>Interchapter 2 Sustaining Curiosity</i></b>	<b>60</b>
<b>Part Two Practicing Critical and Creative Thinking</b>	
<b>3 Becoming a Critical and Creative Thinker</b>	<b>65</b>
Becoming a Critical Thinker	66
Intellectual Standards as Guidelines for Critical Thinking	67
Language and Thought	67
Reports, Inferences, and Judgments	69
The Prevalence and Power of Metaphor	74
Innovating through Analogy	78
Becoming a Creative Thinker	79
Developing the Creative Habit	80
Focus	83
Solo and Group Creativity	85
Concepts as Cognitive Tools	87
Applications	90
References	95
<b><i>Interchapter 3 Embodying Experience</i></b>	<b>96</b>
<b>4 Critical Thinking Strategies and Applications</b>	<b>101</b>
The Nature of Argument	102
Claims, Evidence, and Assumptions	102
Evidence: Claims and Warrants	105
Inductive and Deductive Reasoning	106
Sherlock Holmes as a Logical Thinker	109
Syllogisms, Enthymemes, and Argument	112
Argument and Authority	113
Argument and Analogy	114
Argument and Causality	116

*Contents*

Causality, Coincidence, and Correlation	120
Further Causal Consequences	122
Applications	123
References	129
<b><i>Interchapter 4 Blending Art and Science</i></b>	<b>130</b>
<b>5 Creative Thinking Strategies and Applications</b>	<b>133</b>
Imagination First	134
Imagination, Creativity, and Innovation	135
The Limits of Imagination	136
Capacities for Imaginative Thinking	137
Why Ideas Are Important	139
How to Get Ideas	140
Creative Whacks	147
Being Practical/What If/ing	153
Combining Things	156
Using Paradox	157
Thinking the Unthinkable	160
Applications	161
References	164
<b><i>Interchapter 5 Combining Connections</i></b>	<b>166</b>
<b>Part Three Applying Critical and Creative Thinking</b>	
<b>6 Decision Thinking: Making Critical Decisions</b>	<b>173</b>
Making Decisions	174
Affective Forecasting	180
Achieving Insights that Affect Decisions	184
Institutional Decisions	186
Incentives and Decisions	188
Decisiveness	189
Making Tough Decisions	192
Making Group Decisions	194
Applications	195
References	198
<b><i>Interchapter 6 Embracing Ambiguity</i></b>	<b>200</b>
<b>7 Ethical Thinking: Making Ethical Decisions</b>	<b>205</b>
Basic Ethical Concepts	206

*Contents*

Ethics, Values, and Virtues	209
Ethical Imagination	213
Cosmopolitanism and Global Ethics	218
Technology and Ethics	220
The Ethics of Information	222
Ethical Decisions	224
Ethical Provocations	225
Applications	227
References	231
Index	233

# Preface

When we think about thinking, we often think first of “critical” thinking. The world at large values critical thinking highly—and for good reason. Critical thinking involves analysis and evaluation, interpretation and judgment. Critical thinking is essential for making sense of the world and for understanding ourselves.

To limit thinking, however, only to critical thinking is reductive, even dangerous. To supplement and complement critical thinking, we need “creative” thinking, the kind of imaginative thinking that leads to new ideas, to creativity and innovation. Creative thinking is also highly valued in the world at large. Creative thinking completes and fulfills critical thinking. Either without the other is inadequate. Whole-minded thinkers generate new ideas creatively and evaluate them critically.

Learning to think critically and creatively can make a difference in your personal and professional life. Developing your critical and creative capacities can increase your confidence, deepen your understanding, and improve your performance. Thinking well broadens your perception and enriches your intellectual and emotional well-being.

Not thinking well, on the other hand, reduces the range, depth, and intensity of your lived experience. Not thinking well limits your potential accomplishments. This book can help you overcome such limitations.

Combining critical and creative thinking, this book explains a set of approaches and offers a series of opportunities to think about a wide range of issues and topics. It includes both general guidelines

## *Preface*

and specific techniques to improve your thinking and the thinking of your students. Drawing from and consolidating a wide range of sources, it summarizes and synthesizes key ideas and presents them for your consideration.

A few words about the book's structure. Part One introduces essential concepts for critical and creative thinking. Part Two provides opportunities to practice them. Part Three applies critical and creative thinking to decision-making and questions of ethics. Six interchapters identify essential strategies for developing higher order thinking. Each strategy is associated with a thinking habit of Leonardo da Vinci.

It is one thing to learn about the various ways of thinking that this book provides; it is another, however, to develop skill in using them. To benefit most from what the book offers, you should work through its varied applications. Select a few for your reflections in writing.

There is nothing more vital than developing your capacity to think well about complex issues and questions. This book is designed to help you do just that, while developing your critical and creative thinking powers. These thinking powers can make a difference in how you perceive yourself, how you understand others, and how you experience the world. And they can help you make a similar difference in the lives of your students.

# Acknowledgments

I would like to acknowledge and thank a number of people for encouraging me on the path that eventuated in this book: Bob Boynton and Peter Stillman of Boynton/Cook who published my first book, *Connections*; Kathleen Hulley, who hired me to teach Critical Thinking at NYU; Pat C. Hoy II, former Director of the Expository Writing Program at NYU, who has long been a powerful influence on my own thinking about writing and its relationship to thinking. Bill Costanzo, Distinguished Professor of English at Westchester Community College, SUNY, who has given me much good advice; John Chaffee and Richard van de Lagemaat, two fine critical thinkers with important books on the subject; Nancy Willard Magaud, of the English Language Schools Association (ELSA) in France, who reviewed the manuscript and made helpful suggestions for revision.

At various stages of this book's development, including its many drafts, I received thoughtful and productive responses from a number of reviewers. I would like to thank the following for their input:

Roseanne Abbott, Australia Teacher of the Year in 2013, English Teacher and Department Chair, Callaghan College, New South Wales, Australia.

Jack Bartholomew, Chair of Science, Morristown Beard School, Morristown, New Jersey.

David Blagbrough, former Director of the British Council and of Inspire, a non-profit organization in London that works with at-risk students.

### *Acknowledgments*

George Ewonus, Director, Advanced Placement Program, Canada.

Terence Young, Head of English, St Michael's University School, Victoria, British Columbia, Canada.

At Wiley Blackwell, I have had the good fortune to work with Jayne Fagnoli, who believed in this book from the beginning and who supported its development unstintingly. Mark Graney orchestrated the reviewing process expeditiously, and Julia Kirk managed the books production expertly. Thanks also to all the other Wiley Blackwell staff and freelancers involved in the production of this book. *None of these good people should be held accountable for any errors contained in this book. Any errors are mine alone.*

My final and most important acknowledgment of appreciation is to my wonderful wife, Mary Hammond DiYanni. Mary is a critical and creative thinker *par excellence*. I am fortunate beyond measure to have enjoyed her steadfast love and splendid companionship for more than four decades. My toughest critic, Mary has also been my most ardent supporter. I owe her not less than everything.



# About the Website

Please visit the companion website to view additional content for this title at

[www.wiley.com/go/diyanni/guidetocriticalcreativethinking](http://www.wiley.com/go/diyanni/guidetocriticalcreativethinking)

## **Available to Instructors Only:**

- Detailed lessons, written by the author as well as other teachers, that make thinking visible and call upon students' critical and creative thinking faculties and targeted at middle school, high school, or first-year university students.



# Part One

## Introducing Critical and Creative Thinking





## **What Is Critical Thinking?**

Critical thinking is a type of thinking in which you reflect and analyze when making decisions and solving problems. Based on logic and careful reasoning, critical thinking is purposeful thinking guided by reasoned evidence. It defines problems, identifies competing arguments, uses relevant data, raises key questions, and uses information effectively to make reasoned judgments. The word “critical” derives from the Greek work *kritikos*, which means “judge.” Critical thinking involves rationality and convergent thinking.

Critical thinking does not necessarily involve criticizing ideas (although sometimes, being “critical” in this way can be an aspect of thinking critically). Nor is critical thinking used only for serious subjects or important issues. You can think critically about what kind of popcorn to buy or what hat to wear, whether to marry or remain single, whether you should go to graduate school or move to a foreign country.

Characteristics of critical thinking include noticing perceptively and establishing careful connections; asking probing questions and making meaningful distinctions. Critical thinking involves analyzing, interpreting, and evaluating evidence; applying knowledge; thinking independently and interdependently.

Certain tendencies, or dispositions, are essential for critical thinking. Among them are open-mindedness, honesty, and flexibility; perseverance; reasonableness, diligence, and focus. Critical thinkers reconsider ideas and sometimes change their minds. They recognize the legitimacy of alternative views, embrace ambiguity and remain open to continued learning.

Essential critical thinking competencies include evaluation and self-direction. Evaluation through informed and sound judgments, and through considering values, is central to the process of critical thinking. Self-direction includes self-awareness and self-regulation—managing your thinking and your motivation for thinking. Critical thinking also involves asking productive questions. Asking the right kinds of questions is as important as answering them. Essential significant questions include those shown in Table 1.1.

**Table 1.1** Essential critical thinking questions

---

What do you know?	What have you assumed?
What questions can you ask?	What does it mean?
What is the evidence?	What are the criteria?

---

Underlying these questions is the fundamental critical thinking question: “How do I know what I think I know?” And, “What evidence do I have for what I think I know?”

Critical thinkers constantly challenge their thinking and the thinking of others. They exhibit a stance of deliberate skepticism, refusing to accept assertions without evidence to support them. They also try to consider their own ideas from the perspective of others who might see things differently. The following questions, which have been adapted from Richard Paul’s and Linda Elder’s (2002) *Critical Thinking*, offer guidance in doing this.

*Guiding questions for critical thinking*

1. What are the purpose and goal of the thinking?
2. What question or problem is being addressed?
3. What is the point of view or perspective?
4. What claim or idea is being advanced, and why?
5. What facts, information, or data support the claim or idea?
6. What assumptions are being made, and which of those assumptions might be questioned or challenged?
7. What inferences are being made, and what conclusion is drawn from them?
8. What implications and consequences can be inferred?
9. What concept or theory guides the thinking?

**Habits of Mind**

Your intelligence is the sum of your habits of mind—how you use those mental habits to think and solve problems. This book is designed to improve your current productive habits of mind while helping you modify or eliminate bad thinking habits. The Institute for Habits of Mind identifies and recommends the following

## *Introducing Critical and Creative Thinking*

thinking habits: (1) applying past knowledge to new situations; (2) remaining open to continued learning; (3) posing questions and identifying problems; (4) taking intellectual risks; (5) developing and sustaining curiosity; (6) thinking independently and interdependently.

### *Applying past knowledge to new situations*

Using what you already know, you make connections between prior knowledge and new situations. American philosopher John Dewey reminds us that we learn by reflecting on our experiences. Thomas Edison claimed that he never made mistakes, but rather kept learning what didn't work in the process of figuring out what might.

### *Remaining open to continued learning*

You continue learning all your life, which involves identifying opportunities for continuous learning everywhere. Being "open" to learning opportunities includes being willing to consider other perspectives and ideas, to possibilities for intellectual growth and development wherever they can be found.

### *Posing questions and identifying problems*

Asking productive questions and identifying problems are essential for quality thinking. Socrates asked probing questions, pushing those he questioned ever deeper into inquiry, often to the point of exasperation and an acknowledgment of their ignorance. Questions invite answers; considering answers to thoughtful questions helps you discover the limits of your knowledge.

### *Taking intellectual risks*

Taking risks with your thinking, moving outside your comfort zone prods you to think in new and interesting ways. Taking risks involves the chance of failure; it involves being frustrated by uncertainty. Progress, however, depends upon taking chances. Being willing to fail, and even to embrace failure, is essential for invention and discovery.



*Developing and sustaining intellectual curiosity*

Curiosity is the motivation for all learning. Children are immensely curious about all sorts of things. Many people, unfortunately, lose that curiosity during their years of schooling. One of the greatest thinkers of all time, Leonardo da Vinci, considered curiosity fundamental to his life as an artist, scientist, and inventor. He repeatedly acknowledged curiosity as his most important habit of mind.

*Thinking independently and interdependently*

Although necessary, independent thinking is only part of the story; also necessary is collaborative thinking. The process is reciprocal: you link your thinking with the thinking of others. You feed off the ideas of others, who then feed off yours. Both independent and interdependent thinking spur progress and spark innovation.

## **Why Intellectual Habits and Character Matter**

To become truly useful, these habits of mind need to be actualized as things you do regularly. In making these kinds of thinking habitual, you develop what Ron Ritchhart (2004) has called “intellectual character,” a cohesive way of thinking that is distinctively your own. His notion of intellectual character includes habits of mind, along with patterns of thinking and general dispositions about thinking that reflect how you think. Developing an intellectual character requires building on positive thinking dispositions, such as persistence, patience, and perseverance. Your intellectual character defines you as an individual thinker; it reflects your particular way of engaging the world mindfully.

David Brooks (2014) echoes and extends these ideas with a set of “mental virtues” he believes are embedded in character, virtues necessary for quality higher-order thinking. Among these mental virtues are intellectual courage, which Brooks defines as the “willingness to hold unpopular views.” Firmness and autonomy require an ability to hold to your ideas in the face of opposition. They involve a balancing act between flaccidity and rigidity, and between respect for authority and tradition on one hand, and the ability to depart from those influences, on the other. Brooks adds generosity

and humility to the mix, recognizing others' ideas and acknowledging the limits of your knowledge and understanding. Thinking well requires resisting vanity and laziness, pushing against the need for certainty, resisting the urge to avoid painful truths. In short, good critical thinking for Brooks is a "moral enterprise," one that requires "the ability to go against our lesser impulses for the sake of our higher ones."

Enhancing your ability to think critically can have a pronounced effect on your behavior as well as on your attitude toward learning and the thinking of others. Taking intellectual risks can make you both a more daring thinker and a more interesting one. Being open to the possibility of failure can lead you to a more experimental and exploratory frame of mind, permitting you to try different options with the knowledge that some won't work out. Risk-taking demonstrates a kind of intellectual courage necessary for eventual creative breakthroughs.

Learning to think interdependently enriches your intellectual experience, with opportunities for you to bounce ideas off others and to share in the pleasure of figuring things out together. It also provides practice in the necessary skill of collaboration, which is critically important in today's workplace. Being open to others' ideas and perspectives and willing to change your mind helps to develop skills in negotiation and conflict management, while enhancing your reputation as a reasonable and flexible thinker.

## **Overcoming Obstacles to Thinking**

To develop productive intellectual habits, you need to overcome various obstacles that can block your thinking. In *Conceptual Blockbusting*, James L. Adams (2001) discusses blocks to thought, including perceptual blocks, cultural blocks, intellectual blocks, emotional blocks, and polarizing blocks.

### *Perceptual blocks to thinking*

Perceptual blocks inhibit your ability to make sense of what you are looking at. They interfere with what you can see. To overcome perceptual blocks you keep looking until you can make sense of what you are seeing.

In looking at Picasso's painting *Guernica*, for example, you notice distorted human figures. You can find *Guernica* on many Internet sites, including <http://www.pablopicasso.org/guernica.jsp>.

You see a horse with an open mouth, its tongue a spike, in what appears an agonized scream; you see an extended arm and a hand holding a light. You see distorted human arms and legs, hands and fingers and feet in contorted postures. You see a head thrown back with its mouth open, a person with arms extended upwards, and a hand clutching a sharp object.

Making sense begins with careful noticing. It involves relating the details you see, considering why they have been put together. It involves asking questions about what you observe. In the process you arrive at an understanding of the significance of what you are looking at.

Besides doing your own noticing, you can also ask colleagues or friends what they see and what sense they make of *Guernica*. You can also do some research into what Picasso attempted with this painting, and why he created it. Knowing something about the historical events that inspired Picasso to paint *Guernica* and learning something about the painting's varied contexts can deepen your understanding and enhance your appreciation.

Learning to see ably requires patience, effort, and practice. You prepare yourself to see; you learn how to look. One crucial element for improving your thinking, then, is to become more observant—to broaden and deepen your perception.

To notice the special features of Chartres cathedral, to appreciate the moves of basketball star LeBron James, or the skills of actors, such as Leonardo DiCaprio and Cate Blanchett, you have to know something about architecture, basketball, or acting, respectively. One pillar of observation is knowledge. The more you know about something, the better you see it, understand it, and appreciate it. You may take pride in your knowledge of architecture, basketball, movies and acting, a pride earned through a deepening of knowledge. That deepened knowledge enables you to see more and to see better than those who lack such knowledge. You can overcome perceptual blocks to thinking, then, in a variety of ways. Seeing more and seeing better, and knowing more are some productive perceptual blockbusting strategies.