palgrave macmillan

The Femme Fatale: Images, Histories, Contexts

Helen Hanson Catherine O'Rawe



The Femme Fatale: Images, Histories, Contexts

Also by Helen Hanson

HOLLYWOOD HEROINES: Women in Film Noir and the Female Gothic Film

Also by Catherine O'Rawe

AUTHORIAL ECHOES: Textuality and Self-Plagiarism in the Narrative of Luigi Pirandello

The *Femme Fatale*: Images, Histories, Contexts

Edited by

Helen Hanson

and

Catherine O'Rawe





Introduction, selection and editorial matter © Helen Hanson and Catherine O'Rawe 2010

Individual chapters © Contributors 2010

Softcover reprint of the hardcover 1st edition 2010 978-0-230-20361-7

All rights reserved. No reproduction, copy or transmission of this publication may be made without written permission.

No portion of this publication may be reproduced, copied or transmitted save with written permission or in accordance with the provisions of the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988, or under the terms of any licence permitting limited copying issued by the Copyright Licensing Agency, Saffron House, 6-10 Kirby Street, London EC1N 8TS.

Any person who does any unauthorized act in relation to this publication may be liable to criminal prosecution and civil claims for damages.

The authors have asserted their rights to be identified as the authors of this work in accordance with the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988.

First published 2010 by PALGRAVE MACMILLAN

Palgrave Macmillan in the UK is an imprint of Macmillan Publishers Limited, registered in England, company number 785998, of Houndmills, Basingstoke, Hampshire RG21 6XS.

Palgrave Macmillan in the US is a division of St Martin's Press LLC, 175 Fifth Avenue, New York, NY 10010.

Palgrave Macmillan is the global academic imprint of the above companies and has companies and representatives throughout the world.

Palgrave® and Macmillan® are registered trademarks in the United States, the United Kingdom, Europe and other countries.

ISBN 978-1-349-30144-7 ISBN 978-0-230-28201-8 (eBook) DOI 10.1057/9780230282018

This book is printed on paper suitable for recycling and made from fully managed and sustained forest sources. Logging, pulping and manufacturing processes are expected to conform to the environmental regulations of the country of origin.

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

A catalog record for this book is available from the Library of Congress.

10 9 8 7 6 5 4 3 2 1 19 18 17 16 15 14 13 12 11 10 Dedicated to the memory of Gerry O'Rawe (1929–2008) and Margaret Hanson (1933–2009)

Contents

List of Illustrations	ix
Acknowledgements	X
Notes on Contributors	xi
Introduction: 'Cherchez la femme' Helen Hanson and Catherine O'Rawe	1
1. Ecoutez la <i>Femme</i> : Hear/Here Difference <i>Griselda Pollock</i>	9
Part I Literary and Visual Archetypes	
2. The Mother of All <i>Femmes Fatales</i> : Eve as Temptress in Genesis 3 <i>Karen L. Edwards</i>	35
3. Challenging the Stereotype: The <i>Femme Fatale</i> in <i>Fin-de-Siècle</i> Art and Early Cinema <i>Jess Sully</i>	46
4. Silent Divas: The <i>Femmes Fatales</i> of the Italian <i>Cinema Muto</i> Joy Ramirez	60
5. 'You'll Be the Death of Me': Mata Hari and the Myth of the <i>Femme Fatale Rosie White</i>	72
Part II Film Stars	
6. Diabolically Clever – Clouzot's French Noir Les Diaboliques (1954) Susan Hayward	89
7. Fatal Femininity in Post-War British Film: Investigating the British <i>Femme</i> Melanie Bell	98

8.	'Put the Blame on Mei': Zhang Ziyi and the Politics of Global Stardom Olga Kourelou	113
9.	Gender, Genre and Stardom: Fatality in Italian Neorealist Cinema Catherine O'Rawe	127
	Part III Femmes Fatales in European and World Cinemas	
10.	The Femme Fatale of Spanish Retro Noir: The Recuperation of a Repressed Voice Ann Davies	145
11.	Chiaroscuro: The Half-Glimpsed Femme Fatale of Italian Film Noir Mary Wood	157
12.	A Myth Is Born: The <i>Femme Fatale</i> in the Golden Age of Mexican Cinema <i>John L. Marambio and Marcie Rinka</i>	170
	Part IV Hollywood	
13.	'I Can't Tell Anymore Whether You're Lying': Double Indemnity, Human Desire and the Narratology of Femmes Fatales Steve Neale	187
14.	'Well, Aren't We Ambitious', or 'You've Made up Your Mind I'm Guilty': Reading Women as Wicked in American <i>Film Noir</i> <i>Julie Grossman</i>	199
15.	The Big Seduction: Feminist Film Criticism and the Femme Fatale Helen Hanson	214
Ind	ex	229

Illustrations

1.	Image of Herbert Draper's 'Ulysses and the Sirens' from Bridgeman Art Gallery	9
	Credit: Ulysses and the Sirens, 1910 (oil on canvas) by Draper, Herbert James (1864–1920)	
	© Leeds Museums and Galleries (City Art Gallery) UK / The Bridgeman Art Library	
	Nationality / copyright status: English / out of copyright	
2.	Maud Allan as Salome, in the play by Oscar Wilde (1854–1900)	52
	Credit: Photo by Hulton Archive Getty Images	
3.	Image from <i>Assunta Spina</i> (1915) Credit: Source BFI	60
4.	Image of Greta Garbo in <i>Mata Hari</i> (1931) Credit: MGM / The Kobal Collection / Bull, Clarence Sinclair	73
5.	Press Materials for <i>Easy Money</i> (1948) Courtesy of Cinema Library Credit: The Steve Chibnall archive	104
6.	Image from <i>Ossessione</i> (1943) Credit: Industria Cinematografica Italiana / The Kobal Collection	127
7.	Image from <i>Il Bandito</i> (1946) Credit: DI Laurentiis/Lux Film / The Kobal Collection	157
8.	Image of Maria Felix Credit: The Kobal Collection	171
9.	Image of Gene Tierney in <i>Laura</i> (1944) Credit: 20th Century Fox / The Kobal Collection	200

Acknowledgements

The editors would like to acknowledge the University of Exeter, Departments of English and Modern Languages for supporting the 'Cherchez La Femme' conference out of which this collection arose. We would like to thank all the speakers who gave papers at that conference and those who attended and engaged in debates about the *femme fatale* figure, and Amy McGill and Caroline Green for acting as conference stewards. Thanks are due to Dawn Teed for providing a great deal of administrative help during and after the conference, and to staff at the Exeter Phoenix Arts Centre where the event took place. In addition Catherine O'Rawe would like to acknowledge the support of Danielle Hipkins and Derek Duncan, and Helen Hanson would like to thank Phil Wickham for his help.

Contributors

Melanie Bell is Lecturer in Film at Newcastle University. She has recently published *Femininity in the Frame: Women and 1950s British Popular Cinema* (I. B. Tauris, 2010) and is co-editor of *British Woman's Cinema* (Routledge, 2009). Her most recent research focuses on women film critics in post-war Britain and the methodological questions this raises for women's film history. She is a Steering Committee Member of the AHRC-funded 'Women's Film History Network – UK/Ireland'.

Ann Davies is Senior Lecturer in Spanish at Newcastle University. Her books include *Daniel Calparsoro* (Manchester University Press), *Pedro Almodóvar* (Grant and Cutler) and *Carmen on film: a Cultural History* (Indiana University Press, with Phil Powrie, Chris Perriam and Bruce Babington). She is also co-editor of *The Trouble with Men: Masculinities in European and Hollywood Cinema* (Wallflower Press, with Phil Powrie and Bruce Babington) and *Carmen: from Silent Film to MTV* (Rodopi, with Chris Perriam). She has also written various articles on Hispanic cinema.

Karen L. Edwards is Senior Lecturer in Renaissance Literature at the University of Exeter. Her research focuses generally on the literature and politics of the seventeenth century, especially in relation to the Bible and natural history, and more specifically on the works of John Milton. She is the author of *Milton and the Natural World: Science and Poetry in 'Paradise Lost'* (CUP, 1999) and *Milton's Reformed Animals: An Early Modern Bestiary (Milton Quarterly,* 2005–2009).

Julie Grossman is Professor of English and Communication and Film Studies at Le Moyne College in Syracuse, New York. She is co-editor of *A Due Voci: The Photography of Rita Hammond* (Syracuse University Press, 2003). She has published articles on *film noir*, the Hollywood movie musical, Todd Haynes's *Safe*, Thomas Hardy, Henry James, Oscar Wilde and Karen Finley, and Francis Ford Coppola, *Hearts of Darkness*, and the mockumentary. Her book *Rethinking the Femme Fatale in Film Noir: Ready for Her Close-Up* was published by Palgrave Macmillan in 2009.

Helen Hanson is Senior Lecturer in Film Studies in the Department of English at the University of Exeter. She is the author of *Hollywood Heroines: Women in Film Noir and the Female Gothic Film* (I. B. Tauris, 2007), and the co-editor (with Andrew Spicer) of the *Companion to Film Noir* (Blackwell, forthcoming). She has written essays on the gothic film in *Gothic Studies Journal*, film sound style in the *neo-noir* thriller in *Neo-Noir* (Wallflower, 2009) and sound in *film noir* in *The Cambridge Companion to Film Music* (Cambridge, forthcoming). She is currently researching film sound work and film sound style in the Hollywood studio system.

Susan Hayward is Professor of Cinema Studies at the University of Exeter. She has published widely on French cinema; her books include: French National Cinema (Routledge, 2005), Luc Besson (Manchester, 2007), Simone Signoret: The Star as Cultural Sign (Continuum, 2004), Les Diaboliques (I. B. Tauris, 2005) and French Costume Drama of the 1950s: Fashioning Politics in Film (forthcoming). She is also the author of Cinema Studies: The Key Concepts (Routledge, 2006).

Olga Kourelou is currently completing a PhD thesis at King's College London, on the topic of national and transnational stardom in the Greek context. Her research interests are in star studies and national and transnational cinema, with an emphasis on European cinema and Hollywood. Her work has been published in Ruby Cheung and David Fleming (eds), Cinemas, Identities and Beyond (Cambridge Scholars Press, 2009), and in Raphaëlle Moine, Brigitte Rollet and Geneviève Sellier (eds), Policiers et criminels: un genre européen sur grand et petit écrans (Paris: L'Harmattan, Champs Visuels, 2009).

Dr John L. Marambio is a Professor of Spanish and Linguistics at the University of San Diego, San Diego, California. He holds a degree from Texas Tech University. Dr Marambio has co-authored several articles on the Latino image as portrayed by Hollywood. He is also the author of several articles on Latin American literature and has published *Julio Cortázar y sus mundos literarios* (2000). Dr Marambio has lectured in the United States, Latin America and Europe.

Steve Neale is Professor of Film Studies at Exeter University. He is the author of *Genre and Hollywood* (Routledge, 2000), co-author of *Epics, Spectacles and Blockbusters: A Hollywood History* (Wayne State University Press, 2010), editor of *Genre and Contemporary Hollywood* (BFI, 2002) and co-editor of *'Un-American' Hollywood: Politics And Film In The Blacklist Era* (Rutgers University Press, 2007).

Catherine O'Rawe is Senior Lecturer in Italian at the University of Bristol. She is currently working on a monograph on Italian neorealism and Hollywood, and has articles published and in press on *Romanzo criminale*, *Angela*, and masculinity in contemporary Italian cinema. She is co-editor with Alan O'Leary of the special issue of the journal *Italian Studies* on 'Thinking Italian Film' (2008).

Griselda Pollock is Professor of Social and Critical Histories of Art and Director of the Centre for Cultural Analysis, Theory & History (CentreCATH) at the University of Leeds, England. She has written extensively on modern and contemporary art, developing methods and theories of international, feminist post-colonial cultural analysis with a current focus on trauma. Her recent publications include *Encounters* in the Virtual Feminist Museum: Time, Space and the Archive (2007), as well as edited collections on Encountering Eva Hesse (with Vanessa Corby, 2006), Museums after Modernism: Strategies of Engagement (with Joyce Zemans, 2007), Psychoanalysis and the Image (2006), Conceptual Odysseys: Passages to Cultural Analysis (2007), The Sacred and the Feminine: Imagination and Sexual Difference (2007) and Bluebeard's Legacy: Death and Secrets from Bartòk to Hitchcock (with Victoria Anderson, 2008). Forthcoming are Reading Van Gogh: Memory and Modernity, Theater of Memory: Allothanatography and Trauma in Charlotte Salomon's Life? or Theatre? and Trauma and Aesthetic Inscription/Encryption in the Virtual Feminist Museum.

Joy Ramirez, PhD, Comparative Literature, has taught Italian literature and film at the University of Colorado, the Colorado College and Vanderbilt University. She has lectured and published on topics ranging from film and feminism to Las Vegas and its Italian architectural models. She writes about food and culture, develops and leads educational and culinary trips to Italy and lives in Nashville, Tennessee.

Marcie Rinka received her doctorate in Spanish and Portuguese from Tulane University. She has taught all levels of Spanish language and literature at several US universities, most recently the University of San Diego. Her research interests include Latin American cinema, Latin American women writers, and feminist literary theory. In addition to publishing numerous entries in *The Encyclopedia of Latin American and Caribbean Cultures* (Routledge, 2001) and *Latin American Women Writers: An Encyclopedia* (Routledge, 2009), she is author of a Spanish conversation textbook, *Revista: conversación sin barreras* (Vista, 2007).

Jess Sully completed an MPhil in Comparative Literature and History of Art at Goldsmiths College, University of London in 2006; her thesis challenged the prevalent stereotype of the *femme fatale* in art and literature, c.1850–1910, with a particular emphasis on Symbolism and Decadence. She now works for a government-funded project that accelerates innovation in the creative industries by bringing together creative businesses, technology developers and other interested parties to share ideas and inspiration.

Rosie White is a Senior Lecturer in English at Northumbria University. Her research interests include the novels of Michele Roberts, violent women in popular fiction, film and television, and representations of women spies in popular culture. Her monograph *Violent Femmes: Women as Spies in Popular Culture* was published by Routledge in October 2007 and she is currently developing work on women and television comedy.

Mary Wood is Professor of European Cinema at Birkbeck, University of London. She is Head of the Department of Media and Cultural Studies and responsible for a large film and media programme. Her publications include articles on Italian political cinema, particularly the films of Francesco Rosi; representations of space and landscape; popular crime films and representations of right-wing terrorism. She is the author of *Italian Cinema* (Berg, 2005) and *Contemporary European Cinema* (Hodder Arnold, 2007). She is currently completing a chapter on Franco Zeffirelli and the problem of critical value. Her research on Italian *film noir* continues.

Introduction: 'Cherchez la femme'

Helen Hanson and Catherine O'Rawe

The dark lady, the spider woman, the evil seductress who tempts man and brings about his destruction is among the oldest themes of art, literature, mythology and religion in western culture. She is as old as Eve, and as current as today's movies, comic books and dime novels.

(Place 1998: 47)

She appears time and again in art, poetry and fiction either in her mythical forms or in contemporary guise: she can be prostitute, man-hunting aristocrat, vampire, African queen, native (black) woman or murderess. She crosses boundaries of class and race.

(Stott 1992: viii)

This collection of essays seeks to engage with figurations of the *femme fatale* in a wide range of cultural texts, at different socio-historical junctures and in distinct national/geographical terrains. The idea for the collection arose from a distinct sense that, while the *femme fatale* figure is a recurrent presence in both popular and high culture, the figure is a perennial site of uncertainty, raising challenging questions and inviting further investigation.

The *femme fatale* is thus read simultaneously as both entrenched cultural stereotype and yet never quite fully known: she is always beyond definition. This sense of mystery, of a concealed identity always just beyond the visible surface, is common in critical discussions of the *femme fatale*. Indeed, Mary Ann Doane opens her influential discussion of the *femme fatale* by positing unknowability as her key feature: 'the *femme fatale* is the figure of a certain discursive unease, a potential

epistemological trauma. For her most striking characteristic, perhaps, is the fact that she never really is what she seems to be' (Doane 1991: 1).

Conventionally, the femme is, in diegetic and critical terms, both unknowable and an index of unknowability, always representing more than can be articulated. Doane's model of epistemological trauma emphasizes and interrogates the 'legibility' of the femme, the fetishism of her powerfully attractive visual appearance, which is held in tension with the desire to uncover her hidden essence. In addition, the 'secret' of the *femme*, her motivation, her essence, where she comes from, makes her a readable figure for 'the epistemological drive of narrative itself, the hermeneutic structuration of the classical text' (Doane 1991: 1).

Given her status as locus of mystery, it is appropriate that in the twentieth-century context the femme fatale figure has often been looked for and located within discussions of film noir, with its emphasis on mystery, darkness, motivation and revelation. Indeed, the link between the femme and noir can be read as in many ways a tautological one: if a film has a femme fatale, it is a film noir, and in order to qualify as a noir, the *femme* is indispensable. Feminist work, particularly in the 1970s, on the *femme* as an operation of narrative identified a certain 'resistance' in the figure which has been picked up as a mode of feminist agency: the collection Women in Film Noir, edited by E. Ann Kaplan (1978, 1998) contained many essays which examined the femme fatale as narratively or textually 'contained' but culturally resonant and ideologically challenging, and available to be read 'against the grain'. This volume focused particularly on the female protagonists of a group of canonical noirs, such as Phyllis Dietrichson of Double Indemnity (Wilder 1944), Lana Turner in The Postman Always Rings Twice (Garnett 1946) and of course the eponymous protagonist of Gilda (Charles Vidor 1946). The attraction to feminist critics of the femme resides in the terminal ambiguity of her active sexuality, her narrative agency, her 'visual centrality' (Place 1998: 54) and, conversely, the problematic nature of this sexual 'power'; critics have decried her role as a textual fantasy, and interrogated the enduring stereotype of the sexually powerful woman as a 'symptom of male fears about feminism' (Doane 1991: 2-3).¹

However, critics have worked to challenge this overdetermination of the femme fatale as a noir icon, attempting to displace her from this position of centrality within the genre. Angela Martin noted the inability of *noir* critics to recognize female characters as performing other narrative functions than that of the femme fatale (Martin 1998); Richard Dyer looked for access to the interiority of Gilda, challenging the idea of her unknowability (Dyer 1998). Elisabeth Bronfen, meanwhile,

has argued that the process of reading the femme fatale in film noir as merely 'acted upon' replicates her visual fetishism and overlooks her tragic self-awareness.² The tendency to 'read the femme fatale either as an embodiment of threat or as a textual enigma' overlooks her agency and 'tragic sensibility'. It is also worth noting that the privileging of noir as the location of the femme overlooks the range of ambiguous and tough female characters in crime film and 'drama' in Hollywood of the 1940s and their cross-gendered appeal. Retrospective critical constructions of *noir* as a male genre do not correspond to the historical and industrial reality of the 1940s (see Hanson 2007: 1-32).

The femme fatale is a category as durable, malleable and resistant to definition as *noir* itself: both terms inevitably evoke more than they describe. In a desire to reach beyond film noir and Hollywood, and to avoid replicating the linkage between the femme fatale and film noir, the emphasis in this volume is on tracing the roots of the femme fatale figure across cultures and periods, and on restoring much-needed context by exploring the transnational and historical origins and intertexts out of which this complex feminine archetype has arisen. Each manifestation of the femme fatale has to be studied in relation to its local context and history, as well as in relation to the ways it may have absorbed other traditions of representation.

Although the idea of the femme fatale is 'as old as Eve', or indeed as old as Lilith, Adam's first wife, turned demon and succubus, 3 the femme fatale, at least in Western literature and art, 'is only formulated as a clear and recognizable "type" in the late nineteenth century' (Stott 1992: ix). Across the field of production of European decadentism and symbolism, in the visual arts and literature representations of fatal women drawing upon the archetypes of religion and myth - Judith, Delilah, Lilith, Salome, Circe, Medusa - proliferated.

However, Stott argues for the rootedness of the femme fatale in a British fin-de-siècle marked by anxieties over women's emancipation, and an interest in the punitive classification of female sexuality, a project, she argues, that is congruent with the contemporary imperialist mapping of the unknown. Ultimately, the femme fatale is 'a sign, a figure who crosses discourse boundaries, who is to be found at the intersection of Western racial, sexual and imperial anxieties' (Stott 1992: 30). Thus the femme fatale marks the borders of race and sex, and her 'darkness' is the perfect trope of both her illegibility and unknowability, and of the threat of miscegenation and 'male fears of an engulfing femininity' (Huyssen 1986: 52-3).4 Figures in artworks such as Salome, Rider Haggard's She, and Bram Stoker's female vampires bear out for Stott the

extent to which the *femme fatale* is emblem not just of Otherness, but of 'chaos, darkness, death, all that lies beyond the safe, the known, and the normal' (Stott 1992: 37).

In symptomatic readings of the *fin-de-siècle femme*, she also operates as a figure uniting concerns about social class and economic mobility. The body of the woman becomes a trope of capitalist modernity. and Dijkstra reads the vampire figure as addressing these concerns: 'by 1900 the vampire had come to represent woman as the personification of everything negative that linked sex, ownership and money' (1986: 351). When the woman enters the public sphere she becomes currency; hence the increasing slippage from the nineteenth century onwards between the figures of the actress, the prostitute and the *femme fatale*.⁶ Doane points to this slippage between the female *flâneur* wandering through the urban space of Paris and the prostitute: both represent 'sexuality out of bounds precisely as a result of woman's revised relation to space' (1991: 263). Andreas Huyssen goes further, by arguing that fin-de-siècle discourse obsessively genders mass culture itself as feminine and castrating (Huyssen 1986: 47): within that context the femme fatale's association with 'new technologies of production and reproduction' (Doane 1991: 1), which include the cinema, mediate how the relationship between women and modernity is imagined.

In putting together this collection we have been particularly interested in how the collected perspectives on the *femme fatale* allow us to trace movements between archetypal representations and more local specificities. Essays in the collection explore the cultural and historical specificity of the *femme fatale* figure in context, as well as how particular media and art forms imagine and disseminate the figure. Rather than trying to resolve the multiple definitions or terminological disputes over the classification of the *femme fatale* figure, the essays in the collection make a virtue of the proliferation and diversity of fatal female figures. Analyses encompass Eve, the Sirens, Salome, Mata Hari, Vamps, Divas, La Dolente, La Malinche, ruthless women, and 'good-bad girls'.

The volume begins with Griselda Pollock's injunction: 'Ecoutez la Femme'. In instructing us to listen to the *femme fatale*, she moves away from the fixity of visual representations to explore the role of the acoustic imaginary and the dangerous allure of the female voice. Her essay analyses how both the visual arts and the cinematic imagine and offer constructions of the feminine, suggesting that the sonic realm can offer new ways of thinking of female subjectivity and identity.

The collection is subsequently organized into sections, so that essays grouped together speak to each other. Section One, on literary and

visual archetypes, opens with Karen Edwards addressing Eve as one of the originary fatal female figures, but through her close reading of Genesis she restores an important and neglected aspect to Eve, showing that her vitality is as evident as her fatality. Ranging from the visual arts movements of symbolism and decadentism to early cinema, Jess Sully's essay traces incarnations of Salome, showing how these figures intertwine tradition and modernity, femininity and androgyny. Joy Ramirez then locates the emergence of the diva figure within Italian silent cinema, drawing attention to the ways in which the diva embodied both formal and cultural contradictions in the influential diva films, which navigated anxieties about modernity and change. Rosie White's essay on Mata Hari also addresses these tensions around femininity and modernity, exploring a case study in myth-making: Mata Hari. She investigates the exaggeration of Mata Hari's activities as a spy and the fabrication of her identity as an exotic figure.

The essays in Section Two all focus in different ways on how the meanings and performances of stars interact with figurations of the femme fatale in specific film-making contexts. Through close formal analysis of *mise-en-scène*, framing and performance Susan Hayward explores how Simone Signoret can be read as a 'queer femme' in Henri Clouzot's Les Diaboliques (1955). Melanie Bell's contextual analysis of fatal femininity in British post-war cinema offers fresh perspectives on stars (Greta Gynt), archetypes (female poisoners) and blended genres (the interaction between the crime and gothic films in Britain), all of which interestingly modify the image of the femme fatale. Olga Kourelou's focus is on the politics of transnational stardom. She shows how Zhang Ziyi's formation as a global star involves a crystallization of female archetypes from different genres and with distinct meanings. Kourelou argues that the way in which these are held together within Zhang Zivi's star image reveals the tensions between the global circulation of genres and culturally specific contexts. Catherine O'Rawe's essay also addresses transnational cultural and critical transmissions, this time between European and Hollywood cinema: she analyses the ways in which 'the national' has been a key concept in critical constructions of Italian neorealism, while the presence of the femme fatale in a number of neorealist films evidences the influence of Hollywood cinema. O'Rawe's analysis of the gendered star dynamics of Clara Calamai and Massimo Girotti in Ossessione, and Silvana Mangano and American star Doris Dowling in Riso amaro, reveals new and 'different national and cultural ways of knowing' the femme fatale, and points up the critical boundaries of neorealism and film noir.

Section Three includes essays which map the presence and use of the femme fatale in Spanish, Italian and Mexican cinema. Ann Davies argues that in Spanish 'retro *noir*' the *femme fatale*'s resistance to patriarchal oppression has a wider political meaning as a repudiation of Françoist values. Mary Wood's essay, meanwhile, concentrates on the specificities of 'la dolente', the Italian femme fatale, a figure of suffering which modifies American film noir conventions to fit an Italian context. Wood notes how Italian *film noir* exposes social problems and works through political realities. She maps the 'mutations' of the *femme fatale* in a period which spans the initial influence of American *noir* in the 1940s through to the contemporary period, showing how the figure 'metaphorize[s] existing social and political relations'. Marcie Rinka's and John Marambio's essay explores an oppositional paradigm between iconic figures in Mexican culture, the Virgin of Guadalupe and La Malinche, a figure with an ambivalent cultural heritage, considered as a betrayer by some people and by others a figure unifying Spanish and Aztec cultures. Rinka and Marambio discuss how films such as Doňa Barbara (Fernando de Fuentes 1943) exploited these ambiguities and succeeded in reworking the femme fatale to speak to a Latin American context.

The focus of Section Four is Hollywood cinema. Steve Neale convincingly shows that the way in which femme fatale figures are accessed by viewers is dependent on the mode of narration. By contrasting Phyllis Dietrichson (Barbara Stanwyck) in Double Indemnity (Billy Wilder 1944) with Vicki (Gloria Grahame) in Human Desire Neale shows that character traits attributed to femmes fatales are conditioned by the extent to which knowledge of character motivation is communicated to or withheld from the viewer. Thus Neale offers a flexible and nuanced approach, which can account for the differences in a range of film characterizations. Julie Grossman argues that the strong cultural 'ideation' of the fatal woman has often distorted readings of women in film noir. She re-reads a range of independent female characters in 1940s American film noir, focusing on their qualities of ambition as a way to move out of an 'interpretive dead-end'. Finally, Helen Hanson's essay traces an overview of the currency of the American femme fatale in feminist film criticism. She notes the shifts in that currency and traces the place and value of the *femme fatale* as a complex body of ideas.

To take another example of critical gender trouble, Shoshana Felman, in her seminal 1977 article on the critical debates over Henry James's *The Turn of the Screw*, debates which raged over the madness or otherwise of the female protagonist, and her reliability, observed how 'pronouncements from the various sides of the controversy [...] repeat

unwittingly – with spectacular regularity – all the main lexical motifs of the text' (Felman 2007: 19). Identifying the ways in which criticism on the novel responded to the 'scandal' of its psychoanalytic readings, and tracing the specular relationship between the textual tropes of violence, madness, scandal, the uncanny and unreality, and its learned readers, she noted how 'the critical debate participates in and reproduces the terms of the text itself', and how the critical language itself became a type of textual madness.

Although we do not wish to make similar claims for the body of criticism on the femme fatale, there are, nevertheless, some striking congruences. It is true that we inevitably approach the *femme fatale* through the critical inheritance we have of her (Hanson demonstrates, in historicizing the reception of the cinematic femme fatale, how different critical issues have been at stake at different moments of her reception for different groups).⁷ But critical fascination with the myth of the femme fatale, whether with her ontological status, with her 'generative potency', to quote Felman on James (Felman 2007: 17), or with the possibility of her redemption in the demonstration by the alert critic of her symptomatic function in rupturing patriarchal structures, is, above all, a constant return to the femme, a manifestation of an endlessly unfulfilled desire. We, as critics, feel that something powerful is at stake here, manifested in the twin critical motifs of 'finding' the femme fatale in the text (in the sense of locating her within a representational history of fatal women) and of 'saving' her from the 'scandal' of her critical misinterpretation. In this collection we do not seek to arrive at a 'true' version of the femme fatale, but rather to recognize the ways in which our critical language rehearses, productively and uneasily, the tropes of the femme herself.

Notes

- 1. See Bronfen on the 'critical prejudice which, by treating [the femme fatale] as a symptom of masculine anxieties and not as a subject of feminine desire, allows us as critics to avoid the tragic message she relentlessly embodies' (Bronfen 2004: 115).
- 2. 'Yet the problem with reading the femme fatale as a stereotype of feminine evil, as a symptom of male anxiety, or as a catchphrase for the danger of sexual difference is that it treats this tragic feminine heroine as an encoded figure who exists only as the phantasmic emanation of others, who is acted upon and, when necessary, extinguished, rather than treating her as a separate subject who has agency and is responsible for her decisions. In so doing, feminist critics unwittingly imitate precisely the gesture of fetishism performed by Walter Neff at the very beginning of Double Indemnity, when he

- fixes his gaze on the golden bracelet Phyllis Dietrichson is wearing around her ankle, rather than acknowledging her as a separate human being' (Bronfen 2004: 114).
- 3. On the Romantic recuperation of Lilith by artists such as Rossetti, see Bullen (1999).
- 4. See Gilman (1985: 30) on Mérimée's Carmen (1845) as the quintessential Other: female, black, a gypsy, proletarian.
- 5. See also Evans (2003: 129).
- 6. Work by nineteenth-century positivist criminologists such as the Italian Cesare Lombroso linked femininity, deception, performance and prostitution. See Dalle Vacche (2008: 131).
- 7. In this way we are always obliged to perform a 'reading of the text that will at the same time be articulated with a reading of its readings' (Felman 2007: 22).

Works cited

- Bronfen, E. (2004), 'Femme Fatale: Negotiations of Tragic Desire', in New Literary History, 35:1, 103-16.
- Bullen, J. (1999), 'Dante Gabriel Rossetti and the Mirror of Masculine Desire', in Nineteenth-Century Contexts, 21, 329-52.
- Dalle Vacche, A. (2008), Diva: Passion and Defiance in Early Italian Cinema, Austin: University of Texas Press.
- Dijkstra, B. (1986), Idols of Perversity: Fantasies of Feminine Evil in Fin-de-siècle Culture, Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Doane, M. A. (1991), Femmes Fatales: Feminism, Film Theory, Psychoanalysis, London: Routledge.
- Dyer, R. (1998), 'Resistance through Charisma: Rita Hayworth and Gilda', in E. A. Kaplan (ed.), Women in Film Noir, London: BFI, pp. 115–22.
- Evans, C. (2003), Fashion at the Edge: Spectacle, Modernity and Deathliness, New Haven: Yale University Press.
- Felman, S. (2007), 'Henry James: Madness and the Risks of Practice (Turning the Screw of Interpretation)', in S. Felman, E. Sun, E. Peretz and U. Baer (eds), The Claims of Literature: A Shoshana Felman Reader, New York: Fordham University Press, pp. 15-50.
- Gilman, S. L. (1985), Difference and Pathology: Stereotypes of Sexuality, Race and Madness, Ithaca: Cornell University Press.
- Hanson, H. (2007), Hollywood Heroines: Women in Film Noir and the Female Gothic Film, London: I.B. Tauris.
- Huyssen, A. (1986), After the Great Divide: Modernism, Mass Culture, Postmodernism, Bloomington: Indiana University Press.
- Kaplan, E. A. (1998), Women in Film Noir, London: BFI.
- Martin, A. (1998), "Gilda Didn't Do Any of Those Things You've Been Losing Sleep Over!": The Central Women of 40s Films Noirs', in E. A. Kaplan (ed.), Women in Film Noir: New Edition, London: BFI.
- Place, J. (1998), 'Women in Film Noir', in E. A. Kaplan (ed.), Women in Film Noir, London: BFI, pp. 47-68.
- Stott, R. (1992), The Fabrication of the Late-Victorian Femme Fatale: The Kiss of Death, London: Macmillan.

1

Ecoutez la *Femme*: Hear/Here Difference

Griselda Pollock



 ${\it Illustration 1} \quad {\it Image of Herbert Draper's 'Ulysses and the Sirens' from Bridgeman} \\ {\it Art Gallery.}$

Credit: Ulysses and the Sirens, 1910 (oil on canvas) by Draper, Herbert James (1864–1920). © Leeds Museums and Galleries (City Art Gallery) UK / The Bridgeman Art Library. Nationality / copyright status: English / out of copyright.

The Sirens appear in Book XII of Homer's *Odyssey*. After returning from the underworld, Odysseus and his men are received by Circe, luring the men back to pure animality, but she turns helper, and prepares them for the next stage of their homeward journey. She warns them of several dangers ahead, one of which is the Sirens, who

spellbind any man alive, whoever comes their way. Whoever draws too close, off guard, and catches the Sirens' voices in the air – no sailing home for him, no wife rising to meet him, no happy children beaming up at their father's face. The high thrilling song of the Sirens will transfix him, lolling in their meadow, round them heaps of corpses rotting away, rags of skin shrivelling on their bones. (Homer, *Odyssey*, Book XII, 48–57)

Although complex in their origins as singing sea nymphs or hairless bird-women hybrids, with etymological associations with bees (hence their honeyed voices), the Sirens, always plural, introduce into the imaginary of western culture a radical alterity that binds the feminine, as what is excessive to social order, and hence linked with the nonhuman but also the prehuman/prehistoric, with nature, material and imaginative domination of which alone produces the identity between the social, the cultural and the masculine. If the Sirens represent otherness to Man, the danger attributed to the allure of that otherness consolidates a particular construction of the human subject as he who can resist their dangerous seduction. Thus the human subject is produced firstly in terms of gender, that is, in the masculine, but also in terms of a historically specific mode of a widespread socio-political-economic system: heterosexual patriarchy. For the temporarily wandering man (the Odyssey as allegory of the nobody - Odysseus's name can also mean 'nobody' - undertaking the ordeal of his own re-formation, rediscovery), who listens to the Sirens' song, there is no return to/or arrival at the oikos, home, no return to or arrival at his varied servants and dependents, no mirroring back through women and children of his consolidated subject position signified by the terms/positions of husband, father, proprietor and overlord. Thus the Sirens' song and the words they sing offer something radically dangerous, beyond pleasure, suspending time, without labour, which the subject created in resistance to them considers jouissance, and, hence, death. It is experienced as a kind of going back, rather than going home to the proper place of the proper man. The lure of the Sirens can be translated into the fatal woman precisely when jouissance is linked to death and identified with