Challenges to Implementing Effective Reading Intervention in Schools

Barbara Foorman
EDITOR
Challenges to Implementing Effective Reading Intervention in Schools

Barbara Foorman
EDITOR
Challenges to Implementing Effective Reading Intervention in Schools
Barbara Foorman (ed.)
New Directions for Child and Adolescent Development, no. 154
Editor-in-Chief: Elena L. Grigorenko

New Directions for Child and Adolescent Development, (Print ISSN: 1520-3247; Online ISSN: 1534-8687), is published quarterly by Wiley Subscription Services, Inc., a Wiley Company, 111 River St., Hoboken, NJ 07030-3774 USA.

Postmaster: Send all address changes to New Directions for Child and Adolescent Development, John Wiley & Sons Inc., C/O The Sheridan Press, PO Box 465, Hanover, PA 17331 USA.

Copyright and Copying (in any format)
Copyright © 2016 Wiley Periodicals, Inc., a Wiley Company. All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored or transmitted in any form or by any means without the prior permission in writing from the copyright holder. Authorization to copy items for internal and personal use is granted by the copyright holder for libraries and other users registered with their local Reproduction Rights Organisation (RRO), e.g. Copyright Clearance Center (CCC), 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923, USA (www.copyright.com), provided the appropriate fee is paid directly to the RRO. This consent does not extend to other kinds of copying such as copying for general distribution, for advertising or promotional purposes, for republication, for creating new collective works or for resale. Permissions for such reuse can be obtained using the RightsLink “Request Permissions” link on Wiley Online Library. Special requests should be addressed to: permissions@wiley.com

Information for subscribers
New Directions for Child and Adolescent Development is published in 4 issues per year. Institutional subscription prices for 2017 are:
Print & Online: US$562 (US), US$617 (Canada & Mexico), US$663 (Rest of World), €435 (Europe), £347 (UK). Prices are exclusive of tax. Asia-Pacific GST, Canadian GST/HST and European VAT will be applied at the appropriate rates. For more information on current tax rates, please go to www.wileyonlinelibrary.com/tax-vat. The price includes online access to the current and all online backfiles to January 1st 2013, where available. For other pricing options, including access information and terms and conditions, please visit www.wileyonlinelibrary.com/access.

Delivery Terms and Legal Title
Where the subscription price includes print issues and delivery is to the recipient's address, delivery terms are Delivered at Place (DAP); the recipient is responsible for paying any import duty or taxes. Title to all issues transfers FOB our shipping point, freight prepaid. We will endeavour to fulfill claims for missing or damaged copies within six months of publication, within our reasonable discretion and subject to availability.

Back issues: Single issues from current and recent volumes are available at the current single issue price from cs-journals@wiley.com.

Disclaimer
The Publisher and Editors cannot be held responsible for errors or any consequences arising from the use of information contained in this journal; the views and opinions expressed do not necessarily reflect those of the Publisher and Editors, neither does the publication of advertisements constitute any endorsement by the Publisher and Editors of the products advertised.

Publisher: New Directions for Child and Adolescent Development is published by Wiley Periodicals, Inc., 350 Main St., Malden, MA 02148-5020.

Journal Customer Services: For ordering information, claims and any enquiry concerning your journal subscription please go to www.wileyonlinelibrary.com/journal/cad

Production Editor: Shreya Srivastava (email: sshrivasta@wiley.com).

Wiley's Corporate Citizenship initiative seeks to address the environmental, social, economic, and ethical challenges faced in our business and which are important to our diverse stakeholder groups. Since launching the initiative, we have focused on sharing our content with those in need, enhancing community philanthropy, reducing our carbon impact, creating global guidelines and best practices for paper use, establishing a vendor code of ethics, and engaging our colleagues and other stakeholders in our efforts. Follow our progress at www.wiley.com/go/citizenship

View this journal online at wileyonlinelibrary.com/journal/cad

Wiley is a founding member of the UN-backed HINARI, AGORA, and OARE initiatives. They are now collectively known as Research4Life, making online scientific content available free or at nominal cost to researchers in developing countries. Please visit Wiley’s Content Access - Corporate Citizenship site: http://www.wiley.com/WileyCDA/Section/id-390082.html

Printed in the USA by The Sheridan Group.

Address for Editorial Correspondence: Editor-in-chief, Elena L. Grigorenko, New Directions for Child and Adolescent Development, Email: elena.grigorenko@yale.edu

Abstracting and Indexing Services
The Journal is indexed by Academic Search Alumni Edition (EBSCO Publishing); ASSIA: Applied Social Sciences Index & Abstracts (ProQuest); Environmental Sciences & Pollution Management (ProQuest); ERA: Educational Research Abstracts Online (T&F); ERIC: Educational Resources Information Center (CSC): Health & Safety Science Abstracts (ProQuest); Linguistics & Language Behavior Abstracts (ProQuest); MEDLINE/PubMed (NLM); Pollution Abstracts (ProQuest); Professional Development Collection (EBSCO Publishing); PsychINFO/Psychological Abstracts (APA); Safety Science & Risk Abstracts (ProQuest); Social Services Abstracts (ProQuest); SociINDEX (EBSCO Publishing); Sociological Abstracts (ProQuest).

Cover design: Wiley
Cover Images: © Lava 4 images | Shutterstock

For submission instructions, subscription and all other information visit: wileyonlinelibrary.com/journal/cad
INTRODUCTION TO THE SPECIAL ISSUE:

1. Introduction to the Special Issue: Challenges and Solutions to Implementing Effective Reading Intervention in Schools
   Barbara Foorman
   This introduction presents the challenges and solutions to implementing effective reading intervention in schools in the United States.

2. Implementation Challenges for Tier One and Tier Two School-Based Programs for Early Adolescents
   Maria D. LaRusso, Suzanne Donovan, Catherine Snow
   This article describes the implementation of a classroom-based program called Word Generation (WG) and an intervention program called Strategic Adolescent Research Initiative (STARI) in grades 4–8. Common explanations for low levels of implementation (ranging from 31% to 48%, on average) were lack of time, multiple new initiatives, and time lost to testing and test prep.

3. Implementation of a Text-Based Content Intervention in Secondary Social Studies Classrooms
   Jeanne Wanzek, Sharon Vaughn
   This article describes teacher fidelity in a series of studies of a multi-component intervention with middle and high school social students and students called Promoting Acceleration of Comprehension and Content Through Text (PACT). Fidelity was high for building background knowledge and key vocabulary and low for critical reading and knowledge application.

4. Seven Elements Important to Successful Implementation of Early Literacy Intervention
   Barbara Foorman, Jennifer Dombek, Kevin Smith
   The objective of this article is to describe seven elements important to successful implementation of early literacy intervention: (a) the importance of research-practitioner partnerships, (b) determining the need for early intervention, (c) assessment selection and data use, (d) evaluating curriculum and instructional materials for use in early intervention, (e) scheduling time for intervention, (f) selecting, training, and supporting interventionists, and (g) locating space and maintaining open communications among interventionists, teachers, and parents.
5. Delving Into the Details: Implementing Multitiered K–3 Reading Supports in High-Priority Schools

*Michael D. Coyne, Ashley Oldham, Kaitlin Leonard, Darci Burns, Nicholas Gage*

The purpose of this article is to describe a K–3 reading initiative where school teams serving high percentages of students at risk for reading difficulties “delved into the details” to work to overcome the complexities inherent in implementing multitiered reading supports in high-priority schools.

6. Improving Professional Development to Enhance Reading Outcomes for Students in Special Education

*Christopher J. Lemons, Stephanie Al Otaiba, Sheila J. Conway, Veronica Mellado De La Cruz*

This article focuses on the professional development needed to ensure that pre-service and in-service teachers are prepared to deliver intensive intervention to enhance reading outcomes of students in special education. A key recommendation is that special educators be prepared to design and implement data-based individualization in the area of reading.

7. Commentary: Learning from Variations in Fidelity of Implementation

*Rekha Balu, Fred Doolittle*

This commentary encourages researchers to (a) learn from variation in fidelity to think about points of entry and levers for improvement in implementation and (b) broaden the evaluation focus to include “service contrast” as a factor driving impacts on student outcomes.

8. Commentary: Implementing Interventions: Building a Shared Understanding of Why

*Vibeke Grøver*

This commentary discusses how the articles that comprise this special issue conceptualize what is required for reading interventions to change instruction.


*Russell Gersten*

This commentary discusses how each of the articles in this special issue gets “into the weeds” in terms of studying actual classroom or school implementation of evidence-based promising practices.

INDEX
Introduction to the Special Issue: Challenges and Solutions to Implementing Effective Reading Intervention in Schools

Barbara Foorman

Abstract

This special issue focuses on challenges and solutions to implementing effective reading intervention in schools in the United States. Researchers often develop interventions that prove effective in efficacy studies but then show no impact when implemented at scale in public school settings. The authors of the intervention studies presented here describe a number of common implementation problems stemming from research in primary grades, middle grades, and high schools. Solutions to these implementation problems include establishing researcher–practitioner partnerships to address the systems-level challenges, suggestions for how to obtain buy-in from teachers, and recommendations for reforming preservice and in-service teacher education. © 2016 Wiley Periodicals, Inc.
In spite of federal funding efforts to improve reading from initiatives such as Reading First, Striving Readers, and Response-to-Intervention (also called Multitiered Systems of Support), impacts have been negligible (Boulay, Goodson, Frye, Blocklin, & Price, 2015; Gamse, Jacob, Horst, Boulay, & Unlu, 2008) or even negative (Balu et al., 2015). Only about one-third of fourth- and eighth-grade readers were at or above the proficient level on the 2015 National Assessment of Education Progress (National Center for Education Statistics, 2015). Therefore, implementing effective reading interventions is crucially important in public schools to address these low levels of proficiency.

Researchers often develop interventions that prove effective in efficacy studies but then show no impact when implemented at scale in public-school settings. Familiar problems with implementation are time lost to test preparation, testing, and student misbehavior; several new programs/curricula happening at the same time; inadequate fidelity to treatment protocols; difficulty scheduling time for treatment of sufficient duration and intensity to meet the needs of at-risk students; lack of alignment across tiers of instruction; and poor preservice and in-service training of teachers. Thus, the central problem addressed in this special issue is how to overcome the many systems-level challenges in K–12 public education in order to implement effective reading interventions in elementary, middle, and high schools for the vast numbers of students reading below grade level.

Each Article’s Contribution to This Central Focus

The LaRusso, Donovan, and Snow article, “Implementation Challenges for Tier One and Tier Two School-Based Programs for Early Adolescents,” provides data documenting partial implementation of a classroom-based program and an intervention program in fourth through eighth grades in urban schools: the Tier 1 Word Generation program to improve academic literacy in content-area classrooms, and the Tier 2 STARI (Strategic Adolescent Research Initiative) intervention that aims to improve fluency, word study, and comprehension in below-level students. The article uses teacher reports and rankings of obstacles to implementation, as well as teacher interviews, to analyze why many teachers did not complete the programs. Strikingly, the Word Generation teachers mostly mentioned organizational issues such as constraints on and disruptions to instructional time, whereas the STARI teachers mentioned obstacles located inside the classroom, such as disruptive student behavior.

The Wanzek and Vaughn article, “Implementation of a Text-Based Content Intervention in Secondary Social Studies Classrooms,” examines the implementation of a text-based content intervention, Promoting Acceleration of Comprehension and Content Through Text (PACT), in middle and high school social studies classes. Teachers demonstrated high
implementation fidelity and quality for the instructional components of building background knowledge and teaching key content vocabulary, but lower fidelity and quality of implementation for the instructional components of critical reading and knowledge application.

The Foorman, Dombek, and Smith article describes “Seven Elements Important to Successful Implementation of Early Literacy Intervention.” The elements are the importance of researcher–practitioner partnerships, determining the need for intervention, selecting assessments and using data, evaluating curricula and instructional materials, scheduling time, training and monitoring interventionists for fidelity, locating space, and maintaining open communications. Examples are provided from research and from the authors’ randomized trial of early literacy interventions with at-risk students in grades K–2 in 55 schools across Florida.

Michael Coyne and colleagues’ article, “Delving Into the Details: Implementing Multitiered K–3 Reading Supports in High-Priority Schools,” describes a reading initiative in kindergarten through grade 3 where school teams served high percentages of students at risk for reading difficulties in low-performing schools. The authors claim that in order for classroom and intervention tiers of support to work at a school-wide level, practitioners must move beyond surface-level implementation and delve into the details of building systems, structures, and routines.

The importance of preparing preservice and in-service teachers to deliver intensive reading intervention to students in special education is the topic of the final article by Lemons, Al Otaiba, Conway, and De La Cruz. They highlight what special educators need to know to implement data-based individualization. Additionally, they provide recommendations for improving professional development using findings from federally funded projects.

Commentaries on these five articles are provided by Rekha Balu and Fred Doolittle, Vibeke Grøver, and Russell Gersten. The Balu and Doolittle commentary, “Learning from Variations in Fidelity of Implementation,” is particularly relevant to studies such as those of Word Generation and STARI described in the LaRusso et al. article, who report implementation fidelity to be highly variable. Balu and Doolittle suggest studying whether the variability is within or across schools so as to learn whether implementation problems are issues of teacher training or issues of school or district policy. Gersten’s commentary, “The Tyranny of Time and the Reality Principle,” identifies the overarching theme of the articles as how researchers learn to adjust their view of ideal implementation to the reality of school life. Grøver’s commentary, “Implementing Interventions: Building a Shared Understanding of Why,” focuses on three challenges to implementing reading interventions: (a) identifying institutional barriers to change, (b) identifying intervention components that are not commonly part of the teachers’ repertoires and need attention and support, and (c) building
researcher–practitioner partnerships and a shared understanding of why an intervention would improve reading instruction.

Conclusion

These articles illustrate the challenges of implementing effective reading interventions in school settings. Solutions are more readily found in the primary grades because teachers are accustomed to teaching reading to a diverse classroom of students and have greater flexibility in scheduling intervention for at-risk students. But, no matter what the grade level of the intervention, all authors agree that high-quality implementation requires building researcher–practitioner partnerships that value the importance of effective reading intervention and share a willingness to build the necessary infrastructure. This infrastructure includes (a) professional development that fosters deep knowledge of and accountability for instructional routines and practices that are not typically part of teachers’ repertoires, and (b) removal of such institutional barriers to change as rigid scheduling and disruptions of instructional time due to mandated initiatives and test preparation.

References


BARBARA R. FOORMAN is the Francis Eppes professor of Education, Emeritus director of the Florida Center for Reading Research, and the director of the Regional Educational Laboratory Southeast at Florida State University.
Implementation Challenges for Tier One and Tier Two School-Based Programs for Early Adolescents

Maria D. LaRusso, Suzanne Donovan, Catherine Snow

Abstract

This mixed-method study examined the implementation and the challenges to implementation for participants in randomized controlled trials of two school-based programs for early adolescents: the Tier One Word Generation (WG) program, and the Tier Two Strategic Adolescent Reading Intervention (STARI). Levels of implementation for WG and STARI varied substantially across teachers and classrooms, with mean levels of 40% for fourth- and fifth-grade WG, 31% for sixth- and seventh-grade WG, and 47% for STARI. The three most common implementation challenges for WG were lack of time, multiple new programs/curricula happening at the same time, and time lost to testing and test prep. The three most common implementation challenges for STARI were student misbehavior, student absences, and time lost to testing and test prep. In order to succeed, efforts to find programs that work and to improve educational outcomes must address these formidable problems in U.S. public schools. © 2016 Wiley Periodicals, Inc.