

Springer Theses

Recognizing Outstanding Ph.D. Research

Hayato Hirai

Towards Infrared Finite S -matrix in Quantum Field Theory



Springer

Springer Theses

Recognizing Outstanding Ph.D. Research

Aims and Scope

The series “Springer Theses” brings together a selection of the very best Ph.D. theses from around the world and across the physical sciences. Nominated and endorsed by two recognized specialists, each published volume has been selected for its scientific excellence and the high impact of its contents for the pertinent field of research. For greater accessibility to non-specialists, the published versions include an extended introduction, as well as a foreword by the student’s supervisor explaining the special relevance of the work for the field. As a whole, the series will provide a valuable resource both for newcomers to the research fields described, and for other scientists seeking detailed background information on special questions. Finally, it provides an accredited documentation of the valuable contributions made by today’s younger generation of scientists.

Theses may be nominated for publication in this series by heads of department at internationally leading universities or institutes and should fulfill all of the following criteria

- They must be written in good English.
- The topic should fall within the confines of Chemistry, Physics, Earth Sciences, Engineering and related interdisciplinary fields such as Materials, Nanoscience, Chemical Engineering, Complex Systems and Biophysics.
- The work reported in the thesis must represent a significant scientific advance.
- If the thesis includes previously published material, permission to reproduce this must be gained from the respective copyright holder (a maximum 30% of the thesis should be a verbatim reproduction from the author’s previous publications).
- They must have been examined and passed during the 12 months prior to nomination.
- Each thesis should include a foreword by the supervisor outlining the significance of its content.
- The theses should have a clearly defined structure including an introduction accessible to new PhD students and scientists not expert in the relevant field.

Indexed by zbMATH.

More information about this series at <http://www.springer.com/series/8790>

Hayato Hirai

Towards Infrared Finite S-matrix in Quantum Field Theory

Doctoral Thesis accepted by
Osaka University, Osaka, Japan

Author

Dr. Hayato Hirai
Natural Science Education
National Institute of Technology,
Kisarazu College
Kisarazu, Japan

Supervisor

Prof. Satoshi Yamaguchi
Department of Physics
Osaka University
Osaka, Japan

ISSN 2190-5053

Springer Theses

ISBN 978-981-16-3044-6

<https://doi.org/10.1007/978-981-16-3045-3>

ISSN 2190-5061 (electronic)

ISBN 978-981-16-3045-3 (eBook)

© The Editor(s) (if applicable) and The Author(s), under exclusive license to Springer Nature Singapore Pte Ltd. 2021

This work is subject to copyright. All rights are solely and exclusively licensed by the Publisher, whether the whole or part of the material is concerned, specifically the rights of translation, reprinting, reuse of illustrations, recitation, broadcasting, reproduction on microfilms or in any other physical way, and transmission or information storage and retrieval, electronic adaptation, computer software, or by similar or dissimilar methodology now known or hereafter developed.

The use of general descriptive names, registered names, trademarks, service marks, etc. in this publication does not imply, even in the absence of a specific statement, that such names are exempt from the relevant protective laws and regulations and therefore free for general use.

The publisher, the authors and the editors are safe to assume that the advice and information in this book are believed to be true and accurate at the date of publication. Neither the publisher nor the authors or the editors give a warranty, expressed or implied, with respect to the material contained herein or for any errors or omissions that may have been made. The publisher remains neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.

This Springer imprint is published by the registered company Springer Nature Singapore Pte Ltd. The registered company address is: 152 Beach Road, #21-01/04 Gateway East, Singapore 189721, Singapore

Supervisor's Foreword

It is my great pleasure to introduce the work of Dr. Hayato Hirai, now published in this Springer Thesis series. His work is on the infrared problems in the quantum field theory.

The quantum field theory, which describes the physics of elementary particles, is a very successful theory. The Standard Model is formulated by a quantum field theory and describes matters and forces other than gravity very well. A good example of the success of this theory is that the anomalous magnetic moment of the electron agrees between theory and experiment to more than 8 significant digits. This is one of the best agreements between theory and experiment in physics. However, there are still some conceptually poorly understood aspects of the quantum field theory. One of them is the infrared problem. In a quantum field theory that includes a massless field, there is a divergence from the infrared region, and the S-matrix elements, which quantify the scattering, are not well defined. This is also a problem in quantum electrodynamics, which appears in the early stage of the history of the quantum field theory, and is one of the most successful examples.

A solution to this problem in standard textbooks is called inclusive formalism, which brings up the “resolution of the detector”. In this formalism, although we cannot define the S-matrix elements, we can define the inclusive scattering cross section, which is an observable quantity. Although this has convinced many people, some people still think it is important to define the S-matrix elements in some way, and this has been studied for a long time.

Dr. Hirai recognizes the importance of an infrared finite S-matrix and has done these works. In this thesis, he makes two important contributions towards the construction of an infrared finite S-matrix.

One is to show that what is called “asymptotic symmetry” is a physical symmetry, and furthermore to show that the conservation law for asymptotic symmetry is equivalent to a theorem called “the soft photon theorem”. Asymptotic symmetry is a subtle “symmetry” that at first glance appears to be unphysical, i.e., a symmetry in which the corresponding conserved quantity is always zero regardless of the state. Therefore, its treatment has been controversial. In this work, using a standard formulation called the BRST formalism, he and collaborators have fully clarified that the asymptotic

symmetry is a physical symmetry. Furthermore, they have developed the relation between the sub-leading soft photon theorem and this symmetry. These results have had a great impact on the field.

The other one is that the asymptotic state of electrons proposed by Faddeev and Kulish is shown to be a physical state, using the BRST formalism. Chung, Faddeev, Kulish, and other people were not completely satisfied with inclusive formalism. They have tried to change the concept of asymptotic states and obtain an S-matrix without infrared divergence. They have constructed a class of states, now called "Faddeev-Kulish states". However, since the BRST formalism was not well developed at that time, the Faddeev-Kulish states were not considered to be "physical states". Therefore, people were lost in trying to make them physical. Dr. Hirai and collaborators have fully clarified that Faddeev-Kulish states are physical states using the now-standard method, the BRST formalism. This is a major step in constructing the S-matrix theory without infrared divergence. It will lead to future comparisons with inclusive formalism and experimental verification, which will have a significant impact on the field.

Osaka, Japan
November 2020

Prof. Satoshi Yamaguchi

Parts of this thesis have been published in the following journal articles:

- HS1. H. Hirai and S. Sugishita, “Conservation Laws from Asymptotic Symmetry and Subleading Charges in QED”, *Journal of High Energy Physics* **07** (2018) 122.
HS2. H. Hirai and S. Sugishita, “Dressed states from gauge invariance”, *Journal of High Energy Physics* **06** (2019) 023.

Parts of Chaps. 2, 4 and Appendices A, B, C, E, G are reprinted from [HS1], and parts of Chaps. 5, 6 are reprinted from [HS2], with revisions and with permission.

Acknowledgements

First and foremost, I would like to thank my advisor Satoshi Yamaguchi for his support during my Ph.D. program. I have always been influenced by his very deep understanding of physics and also how to explain complicated concepts in a simple and clear way. I also thank him for allowing me to work freely on the topics that I am interested in and for always supporting my research enormously. Second, I am very grateful to my collaborator, Sotaro Sugishita. This thesis is largely based on the two joint papers with him. I have always enjoyed discussing with him and I have learned so many things through the joint research with him. I would also like to express my appreciation to Kotaro Tamaoka for many discussions and his kind support in the last few years. Third, I would like to thank Masaharu Aoki, Minoru Tanaka, Satoshi Yamaguchi, Shinya Kanemura, and Tetsuya Onogi for reading this thesis carefully and giving me useful comments.

I am also deeply grateful to all the members of the Particle Physics Theory Group at Osaka University for providing me with a good environment during my Ph.D. program. I acknowledge the financial support from the JSPS fellowship for the past year.

Last but not least, I would like to express my gratitude to my family, in particular my parents, for their constant support and encouragement.

Contents

1	Introduction and Summary	1
1.1	Summary of the Author's Results	5
1.2	Organization of This Thesis	6
	References	7
2	Asymptotic Symmetry	9
2.1	Physical Symmetry and Trivial Symmetry	9
2.2	Classical Asymptotic Symmetry	10
2.3	Asymptotic Structure of Minkowski Spacetime and Useful Coordinates	12
2.4	Classical Asymptotic Charge	18
2.5	Classical Charge Conservation Associated with the Asymptotic Symmetry	21
2.5.1	The Asymptotic Charge Conservation and Memory Effect at Leading Order	22
2.5.2	Asymptotic Charge Conservation and Memory Effect at Subleading Order	26
2.6	Asymptotic Symmetry in Quantum Field Theory	29
2.7	Asymptotic Symmetry in Canonical Quantization	29
2.8	Charges Associated with Asymptotic Symmetry in QED	31
2.9	Asymptotic Symmetry in BRST Formalism	33
2.9.1	BRST Quantization in QED and the Correct BRST Charge	34
2.9.2	Large r Expansion of Fields in QED	39
2.9.3	Asymptotic BRST Condition and Asymptotic Symmetry	41
	References	45

3	Infrared Divergences of S-Matrix	47
3.1	S -Matrix	47
3.2	Conventional S -Matrix	50
3.3	Leading Soft Theorem	52
3.4	Subleading Soft Photon Theorem	54
3.5	Infrared Divergences in S -Matrix	57
	References	60
4	Equivalence Between Soft Theorem and Asymptotic Symmetry	61
4.1	Soft Photon Theorem \Leftrightarrow Asymptotic Charge Conservation, at Leading Order	62
4.2	Soft Photon Theorem \Leftrightarrow Asymptotic Charge Conservation, at Subleading Order	64
4.2.1	Hard Part of the Subleading Charges	66
	References	68
5	Towards the IR Finite S-Matrix	71
5.1	Motivations for Seeking IR Finite S -Matrix	71
5.2	Chung's Dressed State	72
5.3	Derivation of the Faddeev-Kulish Dressed State	74
5.4	Problem on the Gauge Invariance of Faddeev-Kulish Dressed State and Our Approach to this Problem	78
5.5	Gauge Invariant Asymptotic States	80
5.6	Interpretation of the Faddeev-Kulish Dresses	82
5.6.1	Coulomb Potential by Point Charges in the Asymptotic Region	83
5.6.2	Coulomb Potential from Dressed States with $i\epsilon$ Prescription	83
5.7	Asymptotic Symmetry in the Dressed State Formalism	86
	References	89
6	Conclusion and Further Discussion	91
6.1	Softness of Dresses and Infrared Scales	92
6.2	Extension to Other Theories	94
6.3	Other Future Directions	94
	References	95
Appendix A: Asymptotic Behavior of the Residual Gauge Parameter		97
Appendix B: Electromagnetic Fields in Null Infinity		101
Appendix C: Asymptotic Expansion of Radiation Fields		107
Appendix D: Gauss Law Constraint in Canonical Quantization of QED		109
Appendix E: Asymptotic Behaviors of the Massive Particles		111

Appendix F: Integration of J_{nm} and Non-negativity of $A_{\beta\alpha}$	115
Appendix G: Derivation of Eq. (4.40)	119
Appendix H: Particle Trajectory Under the Coulomb Force and Phase Factor in FK Dressed State	123

Chapter 1

Introduction and Summary



This thesis is devoted to a better understanding of infrared structures of scattering theory in gauge theories, in particular, *quantum electrodynamics (QED)* in four-dimensional Minkowski spacetime. The investigation of scattering phenomena in the gauge theories describing our world at low energy, such as QED, has a long history since the early nineteenth century. The comparison between theoretical predictions and experimental data of scattering cross-sections has been one of the main sources of ideas in developing the models explaining our world. Nowadays the Standard Model of particle physics has demonstrated tremendous successes in explaining the data provided by collider experiments with great accuracy, at least with the current experimental resolution.

However, the infrared dynamics in the gauge theories involving long-range forces has recently turned out to be worth reinvestigating, which was first triggered by the discovery of the *asymptotic symmetry* in Maxwell and Yang–Mills theory coupled to massless charged matters [1]. Moreover, the discovery of these new symmetries led to the discoveries of a triangle equivalence of seemingly unrelated following three subjects that concern the infrared dynamics in QED, QCD, gravity: *asymptotic symmetry*, *soft theorem*, and *memory effect*. This equivalence, called *infrared triangle*, is one of the main subjects in this thesis.

Asymptotic symmetry transformations, which I will define precisely later, refers to a gauge transformation which changes boundary conditions on asymptotic spacetime regions while keeping physically reasonable fall-offs behaviors of gauge fields. Although asymptotic symmetry is local symmetry, this is *physical symmetry*. The history of the asymptotic symmetry analysis goes back to the seminal work in gravity by Bondi, van der Burg, Metzner and Sachs (BMS) [2, 3] in 1962. They found the infinite-dimensional subgroup of diffeomorphisms of asymptotically flat spacetime that act non-trivially on the boundary data, which is now called the BMS group. On the other hand, as already mentioned, the asymptotic symmetries in gauge theories in asymptotically flat spacetime were revealed recently [1, 4–6].

The *soft theorems* describe the universal property of scattering amplitudes with external *soft* particles *i.e.* massless particles whose energies are much less than the energies of external charged matters. For example, the soft photon theorem [7–14] in QED simply says that the scattering amplitude of the process $\alpha \rightarrow \beta$, say $\mathcal{M}_{\beta\alpha}$, and the one with an additional external soft photon of momentum $k^\mu = (\omega, \mathbf{k})$, say $\mathcal{M}_{\beta\alpha}(k)$, are proportional to each other as

$$\mathcal{M}_{\beta\alpha}(k) = \mathcal{M}_{\beta\alpha} \sum_n^N \frac{\eta_n e_n \epsilon(k) \cdot p_n}{p_n \cdot k} + \mathcal{O}(\omega^0), \quad (1.1)$$

where e_n and p_n are the charge and the four-momentum of n -th particle in the initial state α and the final state β , $\epsilon_\mu(k)$ is the polarization of the soft photon, and η_n is a sign factor which takes $+1$ for particles in β and -1 for particles in α . The factor of proportionality, called the (leading) soft factor, diverges as the energy of soft photon tends to zero, since it is order $\mathcal{O}(\omega^{-1})$. This fact reflects one of the important property of infrared dynamics; the slight acceleration of a charged particle results in the radiation of infinite number of low energy photons.

The *memory effect* is concerned with the detection of waves coming from faraway sources. It has been investigated mainly as a mechanism for the observation of gravitational waves, called the gravitational memory effect. It originates in a proposal in 1974 by Zel'dovich and Polnarev [15], and developed by many others [16–26]. The gravitational memory effect claims that the passage of gravitational waves coming from faraway sources produces a permanent displacement of the metric and results in a permanent displacement of relative position of freely falling particles (viewed as detectors).¹ Although the gravitational memory effect has a long history, the electromagnetic analog of the memory effect was first studied recently [23, 29, 30]. The electromagnetic memory effect is a phenomenon: the total net charge that has passed through at an local angle is given by a permanent displacement of the gauge field at the corresponding angle, instead of the metric in gravity.

The infrared (IR) triangle reveals the surprising fact that the above three subjects, describing seemingly different aspects in infrared (long distance) physics, are just different perspective of one subject. The equivalence of those was first discussed in the Yang–Mills theory [1], and extended to gravity [31–33] and also to QED [4–6]. The equivalence has also been extended to higher orders of the soft expansion (e.g. [34–37]), to higher spacetime dimensions (e.g. [38, 39]), and also to other theories (e.g. [40–42]) by many others.² The IR triangles are not just about the mathematical equivalence among the three things already known because the IR triangles are universal equivalences valid for many theories including massless particles and there were a few theories in which all corners of the triangle were fully understood. In fact, the insight from the viewpoint of the infrared triangle has led to the many discoveries of new corners in many different theories in the last several years (for example,

¹Detection of the memory effect at LISA [27] and at LIGO [28] has been proposed recently.

²We have just referred to relatively old references here because there are too many. We will refer to the references directly related to our works in the later chapters.